

# DEMOCRATIC TRANSITION AND CONSTITUTIONAL JUSTICE

Post *Reformasi* Constitutional  
Adjudication In Indonesia

IWAN SATRIAWAN  
KHAIRIL AZMIN MOKHTAR



IIUM  
Press

# DEMOCRATIC TRANSITION AND CONSTITUTIONAL JUSTICE

Post *Reformasi* Constitutional  
Adjudication In Indonesia

Iwan Satriawan  
Khairil Azmin Mokhtar



IIUM  
Press

Gombak • 2020

First Print, 2020  
©IIUM Press, IIUM

IIUM Press is a member of the Majlis Penerbitan Ilmiah Malaysia – MAPIM  
(Malaysian Scholarly Publishing Council)  
Malaysian Book Publishers Association – MABOPA  
Membership No. 201905

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced,  
stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means,  
electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise,  
without any prior written permission of the publisher.

Perpustakaan Negara Malaysia

Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

Iwan Satriawan

Democratic Transition and Constitutional Justice: Post *Reformasi*  
Constitutional Adjudication in Indonesia / Iwan Satriawan, Khairil  
Azmin Mokhtar.

ISBN 978-967-491-031-0

1. Democracy--Indonesia.
2. Constitutional law--Indonesia.
3. Indonesia--Politics and government.
4. Government publications--Malaysia.

I. Khairil Azmin Mokhtar.

II. Title.

320.9598

*Published by*

IIUM Press

International Islamic University Malaysia  
P.O. Box 10, 50728 Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia  
Tel: +603-6421 5014; Fax: +603-6421 6298

*Printed in Malaysia by*

Reka Cetak Sdn. Bhd.

No. 12 & 14, Jalan Jemuju Empat 16/13D  
Seksyen 16, 40200 Shah Alam  
Selangor Darul Ehsan

# Contents

---

	<i>Figures and Tables</i>	vii
	<i>Statutes</i>	ix
	<i>Foreword by Dean of Ahmad Ibrahim Kulliyah of Laws</i>	xi
	<i>Foreword by Constitutional Court of Justice, Indonesia</i>	xiii
	<i>Preface</i>	xvii
	<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xix
	<i>Abbreviations</i>	xxi
CHAPTER 1	Introduction	1
CHAPTER 2	Democracy	23
CHAPTER 3	Constitutional Adjudication	46
CHAPTER 4	Democratic Transition in Indonesia	95
CHAPTER 5	Constitutional History of Indonesia	113
CHAPTER 6	Constitutional Adjudication in Indonesia	137
CHAPTER 7	The Constitutional Court of the Republic of Indonesia	172
CHAPTER 8	An Assessment of the Constitutional Court of the Republic of Indonesia	189
	<i>Bibliography</i>	211
	<i>Index</i>	221

# Index

---

- abstract norm 49, 87
- abuse of power 16, 60, 90-91, 166, 182, 193
- access to justice 185, 195
- adjudication 5, 12, 14, 46-47, 49, 51, 54, 59, 63, 65, 92, 135, 137, 141, 169, 175, 186, 189
- autonomy 70, 101, 125, 129
  
- Brown v. Board of Education 53
  
- centralised model 79, 194, 199
- check and balance 5, 16, 60, 62, 90, 92, 182, 191, 202, 204
- Chief Justice 169
- concrete norm 49
- Conseil Constitutionnel 48, 81-82
- constitutional adjudication 46, 64, 85-86, 89, 92, 94
  - amendment 101, 171, 179
  - change 95, 118
  - complaints 56, 190
  - democracy 59, 76, 89, 91, 174
  - dialogues 68
  - justice 5, 8, 170-71, 186
  - law 121, 133
  - limitation of government 26
  - preview 47, 81
  - reform 4, 178
  - review 5, 14-15, 160-61, 164, 167, 170, 193, 202
  - rights 8, 64, 72, 165, 167, 178
- constitutionalism 46, 50, 53, 55, 59
- counter-majoritarian difficulty 14, 55, 62, 70, 89
- court procedure 177, 184
  
- de facto* 21, 32, 116
- de jure* 21, 32
- decentralisation 125
- decentralised model 199
- democracy 46, 50-51, 95-96, 100, 105-106, 113, 117-18, 133, 135
  - consolidation 2, 8-9, 18, 21, 32, 35-36, 38
  - reform 20
  - regime 6, 15, 21
  - transition 15, 17, 20, 95, 108, 112
- dictatorial regime 32
- diffused 50, 69
- disputes on jurisdiction 190
- dissolution of political party 7, 146
- DPD 129-30, 134, 152, 156
- DPR 117, 119, 121, 130-31, 134
  
- election 139-41, 146, 158
- executive 115, 117, 132, 136, 162, 164, 166
  - executive-heavy 121, 124, 177
  - extensive 31, 158, 163, 196, 205
  
- federal 52, 55, 114, 116
- freedom 23, 25, 27, 54
  
- guardian of democracy 8, 54, 193
- guardian of the constitution 5, 7, 10, 56, 78, 167, 181, 190, 192, 202
  
- human rights 6, 8, 12, 26, 53, 64, 85, 88

- impartiality 95  
 impeachment 11, 55, 104, 128, 149,  
 163, 177-79  
 independence 1-2, 113, 137, 169,  
 172, 175, 186  
 integrity 1, 4, 79, 95, 160, 169, 177  
 interpretation 10, 39, 68, 76, 179,  
 205  
*Ius Curia Novit* 184  
  
 Judicial Commission 130, 134, 160,  
 164, 189  
     reform 6, 39  
     review 173-74, 177-78, 186  
 judiciary 95, 164, 171, 177, 181,  
 183-84  
 jurisdiction 12, 159, 178, 180, 190  
  
 Konstituante 98, 116-17  
  
 law enforcement 110, 112, 146, 206,  
 209  
 legal-formal 206  
 legislature 166, 177, 186  
 limited government 50, 55, 58, 106  
 local election disputes 189-90, 193-  
 94, 196  
  
 malfunctions in democratic  
     government 63  
 Marbury v. Madison 49, 52, 75, 90  
 mature democracy 9, 111  
 models of democracy 28  
 MPR 141, 156, 174, 178  
 muddled democracy 109, 112  
  
 new emerging democracies 3, 5, 33  
 New Order 2, 117, 121, 125, 127,  
 134, 141, 171, 180  
  
 normative 50, 55-56, 61, 85, 89  
 number of justices 195, 201, 209  
  
*objectum litis* 190  
 Old Order 2, 95, 114, 116, 141  
 Open for Public 184  
  
*Pancasila* 2, 99, 127, 155, 176  
 Parliament 161, 164, 174, 183  
     sovereignty 51, 55, 58, 62, 89  
*Pengadilan Negeri* 159  
*Pengadilan Tinggi* 159  
 people's basic rights 12, 46-47, 56  
 People's Consultative Assembly 33,  
 117-19, 140-41, 156, 162-63,  
 167, 191  
 people's sovereignty 23, 26, 31,  
 138, 149  
 posteriori 49  
 president 62, 83  
 presidential decree 141  
     system 104, 128, 134, 149  
 preventive control of the  
     constitutionality 85  
 Prime Minister 96, 99  
 priori 49, 81  
 procedure 103, 122, 131, 133, 148,  
 155  
  
*rechstaat* 102  
 Reform Order 120, 141  
 removed 89, 123, 163, 170  
 rights of minority 26  
 rule of law 3-5, 15, 21, 27, 37-39, 45  
  
 separation of powers 48, 99, 103,  
 125, 162, 166, 170, 172, 174, 177  
 Shariah 138, 175  
 sovereignty 134, 139, 161-62, 176

- state 116
- subjectum litis* 190
- substantive 48, 68, 153, 183, 188,  
206-207
- supremacy 50, 53, 62, 73, 76
- supreme court 52, 78-79, 85, 92, 94
  - law 12, 47, 51, 59, 62, 76, 91,  
137, 175
  
- the 1998 political reform 33, 95
- the only game in town 32-33
  
- threat to democracy 68
- two turnover test 34, 111
- type of democracy 97
- tyranny of the majority 51, 62, 108,  
137, 167
  
- unitary 134, 155
  
- violation of constitutional values 47
  
- working of democracy 67



# DEMOCRATIC TRANSITION AND CONSTITUTIONAL JUSTICE

Post *Reformasi* Constitutional  
Adjudication In Indonesia

In this book the authors establish that democratic constitutional and political transformations in Indonesia after the 1998 Reformasi had been given impetus with the establishment of the Constitutional Court. The work presents comprehensive and critical analysis of the development of constitutional adjudication, and the working of the Indonesian Constitutional Court and its role in the process of the democratic transition and consolidation of the country. Through its decisions the Court has emerged as an important institution in protecting the fundamental rights of citizen and in improving the quality of election. The amendment of the 1945 Constitution from 1999 to 2002 has made constitutional and democratic principles based the rule of law much clearer. With the assistance of the Constitutional Court the nation has successfully conducted peaceful general elections in 1999, 2004 and 2009. There are some weaknesses in the process of elections which been discussed critically in the book. These issues are reminders that the democratic consolidation in Indonesia is not finished yet and there still room for improvement. The book is an essential reference for scholars, students, policymakers and anybody who believes that constitutional reform is an important step in shaping the country to a better way.

IWAN SATRIAWAN is an Associate Professor in Constitutional Law at Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta (UMY), Indonesia. He is currently the Vice Dean on Research, Publication and Community Service, Faculty of Law, UMY. He also practices as constitutional lawyer at Satriawan Edo & Co, a law firm in Yogyakarta. He is one of the members of Indonesian Association of Constitutional Law and Administrative Law and Indonesian Association of Comparative Law. He received his Bachelor of Law from Gadjah Mada University, Indonesia and Master of Comparative Laws from International Islamic University Malaysia (IIUM) with specialization in constitutional law. He obtained his doctorate degree from Ahmad Ibrahim Kulliyah of Laws, IIUM in 2017.

KHAIRIL AZMIN MOKHTAR is an Associate Professor at Ahmad Ibrahim Kulliyah of Laws (AIKOL), International Islamic University Malaysia (IIUM). He obtained LLB (Hons) and Master of Comparative Laws (MCL) from IIUM, and earned his PhD in Law from University of Aberystwyth, the United Kingdom. He has taught various law subjects to undergraduate and postgraduate students and supervised thesis for PhD and master students in various topics especially on constitutional law and human rights. He has edited several books including 'Constitutional Law and Human Rights in Malaysia' and 'Election Law', and co-authored several books.

ISBN 978-967-491-031-0



9 789674 910310

## IIUM Press

- ☎ (603) 6421 5014 / 5018
- ☎ (603) 6421 6298
- ✉ [iiumbookshop@iium.edu.my](mailto:iiumbookshop@iium.edu.my)
- 🌐 [iiumbookshop.com](http://iiumbookshop.com)
- 📘 [www.facebook.com/iiumpress](https://www.facebook.com/iiumpress)
- 📷 [www.instagram.com/iium\\_press](https://www.instagram.com/iium_press)
- 🐦 <https://twitter.com/PressIium>



IIUM  
Press