



CRIMINAL RESPONSIBILITY AND ITS EXCEPTIONS

Harmonization Between Islamic Criminal Law
(Al-Jinaei Islami) and Malaysian Penal Code

MOHAMAD ISMAIL MOHAMAD YUNUS



CRIMINAL RESPONSIBILITY AND ITS EXCEPTIONS

Harmonization Between Islamic Criminal Law
(Al-Jinaei Islami) and Malaysian Penal Code

DR. HJ. MOHAMAD ISMAIL BIN HJ. MOHAMAD YUNUS

Advocate & Solicitor

High Court of Malaya

BCM/2323

CRIMINAL RESPONSIBILITY AND ITS EXCEPTIONS

Harmonization Between Islamic Criminal Law
(Al-Jinaei Islami) and Malaysian Penal Code

MOHAMAD ISMAIL MOHAMAD YUNUS


**Penerbit
UTHM**
2020

© Penerbit UTHM
First Published 2020

Copyright reserved. Reproduction of any articles, illustrations and content of this book in any form be it electronic, mechanical photocopy, recording or any other form without any prior written permission from The Publisher's Office of Universiti Tun Hussein Onn Malaysia, Parit Raja, Batu Pahat, Johor is prohibited. Any negotiations are subjected to calculations of royalty and honorarium.

Perpustakaan Negara Malaysia Cataloguing—in—Publication Data

Mohamad Ismail Mohamad Yunus

CRIMINAL RESPONSIBILITY AND ITS EXCEPTIONS :

Harmonization Between Islamic Criminal Law (Al-Jinaei Islami) and Malaysian Penal Code / MOHAMAD ISMAIL MOHAMAD YUNUS.

ISBN 978-967-2389-68-2

1. Criminal law (Islamic law)--Malaysia.
2. Criminal law--Malaysia.
3. Islamic law.
4. Government publications--Malaysia.

I. Title.

340.5909595

Published by:
Penerbit UTHM
Universiti Tun Hussein Onn
Malaysia
86400 Parit Raja,
Batu Pahat, Johor
Tel: 07-453 8698/ 8529
Fax: 07-453 6145

Website: <http://penerbit.uthm.edu.my>
E-mail: pt@uthm.edu.my
<http://e-bookstore.uthm.edu.my>

Penerbit UTHM is a member of
Majlis Penerbitan Ilmiah Malaysia
(MAPIM)

Printed by:
PERCETAKAN IMPIAN SDN BHD
No. 67 Jalan Bukit 9
Kawasan Perindustrian MIEL
Bandar Baru Seri Alam,
81750 Masai, Johor Bahru

Table of Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	<i>xvii</i>
<i>Table of Statutes</i>	<i>xxi</i>
<i>Abbreviations of Journals/ Articles and Periodical</i>	<i>xxiii</i>
<i>Glossary</i>	<i>xxvii</i>
<i>Author's Preface</i>	<i>xxix</i>
<i>Foreword</i>	<i>xxx</i>
Chapter One	1
Introduction to Islamic Criminal Law (<i>Al-Shariah</i>) and Malaysian Penal Code	
Introduction to Islamic Law (<i>Al-Shariah</i>)	2
Part I. The Islamic law (<i>Al-Shariah</i>)	3
Part II. The Major Schools of Islamic Law and Their Founders	4
Part III. Introduction to Malaysian Penal Code (MPC)	5
A. Interpretations	7
1. Law.	7
2. Public Law	7
3. Private Law (Civil Law)	7
4. Criminal Law	8
5. Crime	8
B. The Differences between Criminal Law and Civil Law	9
C. The Similarities and Differences between Islamic Law and Modern Secular Law	10
1. The Similarities	10
a. Common Objectives between Islamic Law (<i>Maqasid Al Shariah</i>) and Modern Secular Law	10
b. Enlightening the individuals with knowledge	10
c. Establishing of Justice	11
d. The <i>Shariah</i> and man-made law contain exceptional principles in the implementation of its laws	13

2. The Differences between Islamic law and Man-made law	13
a. <i>Shariah</i> is a Divine Law	13
b. <i>Shariah</i> law is free from discrepancies and shortcomings	14
c. Respecting, Honoring and Obeying the Commandments	16
d. <i>Shariah</i> is Universal, Realistic and Contemporary	17
e. The <i>Shariah</i> propagates the Protection of Interest and Rejection of Evil	18
f. The <i>Shariah</i> Contains Flexible Principles	18
g. The <i>Shariah</i> contains Universal Principles	20
h. The Rewards and Punishments in <i>Shariah</i> is in this World and in the Hereafter	21
i. The Completeness of the <i>Shariah</i>	22
j. Verses related to spiritual matters	23
k. Verse related to family affairs	23
l. Verses related to contract and financial matters	24
m. Verses related to criminal matters	24
n. Verses related to political system	25
o. Verses related to International relations	25

Chapter Two	27
Sources of Islamic Law (<i>Al-Shariah</i>)	

Introduction	27
Part I. The Primary Sources of Islamic Law	29
A. The Holy <i>Quran</i>	29
1. The Meaning of Holy <i>Quran</i>	29
2. The Exegesis of the Holy <i>Quran</i>	30
B. The <i>Sunnah</i> [The Practice of Prophet Muhammad (pbuh)]	32
The Meaning of <i>As-Sunnah</i>	33
Part II. The Secondary Sources of Islamic Law	33
A. The Consensus of Opinions (<i>Al-Ijma</i>)	34

1. Definition of Consensus	34
2. The Legal Basis of Consensus	34
3. The Position of Laws, Regulations and Resolution in Islamic Legal System	35
B. The Analogical Deduction (<i>Al-Qiyas</i>)	35
1. Definition of Analogy	35
2. The Legal Basis of Analogy	35
3. Admissibility of Analogy	36
C. The Interpretation (<i>Al-Ijtihad</i>)	36
Meaning of <i>Al-Ijtihad</i>	36
D. Public Interest or Public Policy (<i>Istihsan</i> or <i>Istislah</i> or <i>Masalih al-Mursalah</i>)	37
1. Meaning of Public Interest (<i>Istihsan</i>)	37
2. The Legal Basis of Public Interest (<i>Istihsan</i>)	38
E. The Legal Presumption (<i>Istishab</i>)	38
F. Customs and Usages (<i>Urf</i>)	39
Chapter Three	41
The Categories of Punishment and Its Exceptions Under the Islamic Criminal Law	
Introduction	42
Part I. Categories of Punishment	42
Part II. The Prescribed Legal Punishments (<i>Hudud</i>)	42
Prevention of the Prescribed Legal Penalty in Cases of Doubt	43
Part III. The Discretionary Punishment (<i>Tazir</i>)	43
Part IV. The Law of Equality or Retaliation (<i>Qisas</i>)	44
Part V. The Exceptions to Criminal Liability	45

Chapter Four	47
Essential Elements of Crime under the Islamic Law	
Introduction	48
Part I. Physical Element – <i>Actus Reus</i>	49
A. Kinds of <i>Actus Reus</i>	49
1. Conduct Crime	49
2. Result Crime	50
B. Proving Actus Reus	50
C. Commission as <i>Actus Reus</i>	50
D. Voluntariness in Commission	52
Part II. The Position at Common Law	52
Part III. The Position under the Malaysian Penal Code	53
A. Omission as <i>Actus Reus</i>	54
B. The Parties Relationship	54
C. The Circumstances of the <i>Actus Reus</i>	55
D. Presumption of Contractual Obligations	55
E. Presumption of Non-Contractual Obligations	56
Part IV. The Mental Element – <i>Mens Rea</i>	56
A. Terminologies of <i>Mens Rea</i> under the Penal Code	59
1. Intention	59
2. Recklessness	60
3. Knowledge	61
4. Rashly and Negligently	62
5. Malignantly	63
6. Dishonestly	63
7. Fraudulently	64
8. Voluntarily	64
B. Proofing <i>Mens Rea</i>	64
Conclusion	67

Chapter Five	69
The Concept of Strict Liability	
Introduction	70
Part I. The Application of Strict Liability	71
Part II. The Scope of Strict Liability	73
Part III. The Doctrine of Strict Liability	74
A. The Status at Common Law	74
B. The Status under the Penal Code	75
C. Strict Liability Offences and The Penal Code	77
D. Justifications and Critiques On Strict Liability	78
1. Justification	78
2. Critiques	82
E. Rationale of Strict Liability	86
F. Method of Interpretation	87
G. Analogy of <i>Mens Rea</i>	89
H. Rebutting The Presumption	90
1. Public Welfare Offences	90
2. Achievement of the Legal Objectives	91
I. Case Study on Strict Liability Offences	92
J. Commentary On Strict Liability	94
Conclusion	97
Chapter Six	99
Defence of Mistake of Fact and Law	
Introduction	99
Part I. The Standard of Proof in the Defence of Mistakes	101
1. Mistake of Fact	101
2. Mistake of Law	102
Part II. Mistake of Fact under the Penal Code	104
A. The Differences between Sections 76 and 79	105
B. The Scope of both Sections	106
Part III. Constituents Elements of the Defense	110

A. Nothing is an offence	110
B. Bound by law; justified by law or believing to be bound or justified by law	110
C. Act must be done in good faith	111
Part IV. Case Study on Mistake of Fact	111
A. Mistake of fact	112
B. Mistake done by Judiciary Officers: Judicial Act (ss 77 & 78 PC)	113
Part V. The Defense of Mistake of Law	115
Part VI. Mistake of Mixed (Law and Fact)	117
Part VII. Distinction of Mistake of Fact and Mistake of Law	118
Conclusion	119
Chapter Seven	121
Defence of Accident	
Introduction	122
Part I. The Meaning of Accident	123
Part II. The Defence of Accident under the Islamic Criminal Law	125
Part III. The Principles of Defence of Accident under the Penal Code	127
The Elements of Defence	129
A. The alleged offence was the result of an accident or misfortune	129
B. The act-giving rise to the accident was not done with the criminal intention or knowledge	130
C. The act was lawful and performed in a lawful manner by lawful means	130
D. The Act was done with the proper care and caution	131
Part IV. Burden of Proof	132
Part V. The Development and Application of the Defence of Accident	133
A. Malaysia	133
B. Australia	135
Part VI. Case Study on Accident	138
A. Act while sleeping	138

B. Act of Wrestling	139
C. Act of Shooting or Hunting	140
D. Act of Driving	140
E. Act of Automatism	141
Conclusion	141
Chapter Eight	143
Defence of Infancy	
Introduction	144
Part I. Meaning of Infancy	146
Part II. Defence of Infancy under the Penal Code	148
A. Section 82 of the Penal Code	148
B. Scope of Section 82 Penal Code	149
1. Indian Penal Code	149
2. Common Law Position	150
Part III. Section 83 of the Penal Code	151
A. Scope of Section 83 Penal Code	152
1. Indian Penal Code	152
2. Common Law Position	152
3. Ingredients under Section 83 of the Penal Code	154
Part IV. Trial Procedure in Children Court	157
A. Age as a Mitigating Factor	159
B. Public Interest / Welfare is the Supreme Law	161
Conclusion	165
Chapter Nine	167
Defense of Necessity	
Introduction	168
Illustrations	168
Part I. The Objective of the Defence	170
Part II. Objectivity vs Subjectivity	172
Applications of the Maxim	173

Part III. Scope and Application of Necessity	193
Examples of the Maxim	175
Part IV. The Ingredients of Section 81 of the Penal Code	176
A. Without Any Criminal Intention	176
B. Good Faith	178
C. Prevention or Avoidance of Other Harm to Person or Property	179
D. No Other Means Than Necessary For Every Harm or Things Cause	181
Part V. Case Study on the Defense of Necessity	183
Part VI. Relevancy of English Cases And Section 81 of the Penal Code	186
Conclusion	188
Chapter Ten	191
The Defense of Unsoundness of Mind	
Introduction	192
Part I. Meaning of Insanity	193
Part II. Legal Ingredients of Insanity	194
A. Nothing is an offence	194
B. At the time of committing the act	194
C. Unsoundness of mind	195
D. Incapable of Knowing	196
Part IV. Principles of the <i>McNaughten's</i> case	197
Part V. The Important Principles to Prove Insanity based on <i>McNaughten's</i> Rule	198
A. Nature and quality of the act	198
B. Doing what is either wrong or contrary to law	198
Part VI. Defense of Insanity in Malaysia	201
Part VII. The Burden and Standard of Proof	204
Conclusion	205

Chapter Eleven	207
The Defense of Consent	
Introduction	207
Part I. The Meaning and Scope of Consent	209
Part II. A Commentary on the Penal Code	211
A. The Scope and Application of Section 87 Penal Code	211
B. The Age of Consent	212
C. The Scope and Application of Section 88 Penal Code	213
D. Surgical Operations	213
E. The Scope and Application of Section 90 Penal Code	214
Part III. Differences between Consent and Submission	217
Conclusion	217
Chapter Twelve	219
The Defence of Duress	
Introduction	220
Part I. Meaning of Duress	220
Part II. Types of Duress	223
A. Duress Proper	223
B. Duress Improper	223
Duress to utter and do something	224
Part III. The Defence of Duress	225
Part IV. Rational of the Defense of Duress	228
Part V. Duress under Penal Code	230
A. Treat must be of death	231
B. Treat must be of instant Death	231
C. Treat is Objective in Character	235
D. Treat must be directed to the accused	235
E. Voluntary exposure to threats	236
F. Restrictions on use of defense	236
Part VI. Conditions of Duress Under the Islamic Law	237
A. Duress should be a proper one	237

B. The threatener must be capable to execute his threat	238
C. The act compelled to do must be an act, which is prohibited by law	238
D. The threat must be objective in character	238
E. The threat should be of immediate nature	238
a. Duress Practical	240
b. Duress Inherent	240
Part VII. Duress in the Case of Murder	240
A. Duress in the Case of Murder at Common Law	240
B. Duress in the case of murder under Malaysian and Islamic Law	241
Conclusion	243
Chapter Thirteen	247
The Right of Private Defence	
Introduction	247
Part I. Meaning of Private Defense	249
Part II. The Importance and Significance of the Right of Private Defence	249
Part III. Principles Governed the Right of Private Defence	250
A. No Other Recourse	251
B. Proportionality and Reasonableness	251
C. Acts of Public Servants	252
Part IV. The Applications of the Islamic Legal Maxim	254
Part V. The Right of Private Defence of Property Under the Penal Code	255
A. Scope of the Defence	255
B. Reasonable Apprehension of Danger	256
Part VI. Commencement and Continuance of Right of Private Defence	257
Part VII. Exceeding the Right of Private Defence	260
Part VIII. The Right of Private Defence of Person Under The Penal Code	262
A. Scope of the Defence	262

B. Reasonable Apprehension of Danger and Mistake	262
C. Right of Private Defence of Aggressor	263
D. Restrictions on Right of Private Defence	264
Conclusion	267
Chapter Fourteen	269
Common Object & Intention	
Introduction	269
Part I. Meaning of Common Object and Intention	272
A. Criminal Act	272
B. Common Criminal Intention	273
C. Criminal Act Identical to Crime Actually Committed	273
D. Criminal Act Distinguished From "Crime Actually Committed"	274
Part II. Common Criminal Intention under the Islamic Criminal Law	277
A. A person may commit an offence all-alone or commit it along with some other person	277
B. Accountability in cases of agreement and concurrence	278
C. A criminal act if done by several persons in furtherance of the common intention of all, each of such person is liable for that act in the same manner as if the act was done by him an individual	279
D. Furtherance of Common Intention	280
E. Common Intention and Pre-Arranged Plan	281
F. Participation and Mere Presence	283
Part III. The Inter-Relation Between Common Object and Common Intention	285
Part IV. The Distinction Between Common Intention and Common Object	288
Conclusion	290

Chapter Fifteen	293
Harmonization Between Malaysian Penal Code and Brunei Darussalam <i>Syariah</i> Penal Code Order 2013	
Introduction	294
Part I. Defence of Infancy	295
A. The Difference Between Section 83 MPC and Section 13 of the Order	296
B. Defence of Consent	296
1. Section 89 MPC and Section 18 [Order]	297
2. Section 90 MPC and Section 19 [Order]	297
Part II. The Right of Private Defence	298
A. Section 96 MPC and Section 25 [Order]	298
B. Section 97 MPC and Section 26 [Order]	298
C. Section 98 MPC and Section 27 [Order]	299
D. Section 99 MPC and Section 28 [Order]	299
E. Section 100 MPC and Section 29 [Order]	300
F. Section 103 MPC and Section 32 [Order]	301
G. Section 104 MPC and Section 34 [Order]	301
H. Section 105 MPC and Section 34 [Order]	302
<i>Conclusion</i>	302
<i>Bibliography</i>	305
<i>About the Author</i>	317
<i>Index</i>	319

CRIMINAL RESPONSIBILITY AND ITS EXCEPTIONS

Harmonization Between Islamic Criminal Law
(Al-Jinaei Islami) and Malaysian Penal Code

The subject of criminal law is required for the LL.B program as specified by Malaysian Qualifications Agency (MQA). Thus, the book on Criminal Responsibility & Its General Exceptions: Harmonization Between Malaysian Penal Code and Islamic Criminal Law is a compulsory reference, required reading and a must textbook for every law students. This book deals with the comparative study on the general exceptions to criminal liability in Malaysia and Islamic Law, i.e. the characteristic features of the Malaysian Penal Code (MPC) and its interpretations. It also introduces a comparative appraisal approach on the plethora of authorities from Malaysia, Singapore, Brunei, India, Pakistan, England and Islamic Law (Al-Shariah) as well.

The main objective of this book is to deal with the process of harmonization of substantive law between the two legal system i.e. Islamic criminal law and Malaysian Penal Code.



For more information,
please scan the code

