COMPARATIVE JURISPRUDENCE

A Comparative Appraisal of Western Jurisprudence and Islamic Jurisprudence

ABDUL HASEEB ANSARI

SERIALS PUBLICATIONS PVT. LTD.
New Delhi (India)
Contents

Preface xcvii
Foreword xix
List of Cases xxxi
Abbreviations xxxvii

1. Introduction........................................................................................................ 1-8

2. Meaning, Scope and Relevance of Jurisprudence........................................... 9-70
   A Comparative Exposition
   2.1 Nature, Scope and Relevance of Jurisprudence 9
      2.1.1 Nature of Jurisprudence 9
      2.1.2 Scope of Jurisprudence 17
      2.1.3 Jurisprudence as Science and as Philosophy 21
      2.1.4 Relevance of Jurisprudence 22
   2.2 Inconsistency in Legal Theories 28
   2.3 Nature, Scope and Relevance of Islamic Jurisprudence 34
      2.3.1 Nature 34
      2.3.2 Scope 40
      2.3.3 Relevance 41
   2.4 Unanimity and Divergence in the Four Sunni Madhab (Schools of Law) 43
      2.4.1 The Hanafi School 43
      2.4.2 The Maliki School 45
      2.4.3 The Shafi'i School 46
2.4.4 The Hanbali School 47
2.4.5 A Comparative Assessment of the Four Schools of Thought 48
2.4.6 Comparison with the Western Schools 49
2.4.7 Orientalists’ Criticisms of Islamic Law and Reply to Them 50
  2.4.7.1 Islamic Law Talks About Both Rights and Duties 51
  2.4.7.2 There is Plenty of Scope to Develop Law on the Basis of Human Reason 52
  2.4.7.3 The Issue of Women’s Testimony 55
  2.4.7.4 Islamic Laws Do Not Suffer from Antiquity 58
  2.4.7.5 Islamic Law is Not Barbaric 59
  2.4.7.6 It is Possible to Codify Islamic Law 62
  2.4.7.7 There is no Discrimination Against Non-Muslim Minorities 62
  2.4.7.8 Islam is a Religion of Peace and Amity 64
  2.4.7.9 Islam Does Not Provide Husbands Right to Divorce Arbitrarily 64

2.5 Comparison: Conclusion 65
References 68

3. Natural Law Theories and their Affinity with Islamic Jurisprudence 71-116

  3.1 Introduction 71
  3.2 Development of Natural Law Theory Through Ages 74
    3.2.1 Greek Theories 74
    3.2.2 Roman Theories 76
    3.2.3 Theories of the Middle Ages 78
    3.2.4 Theories in Sixteenth to Eighteenth Centuries 84
      3.2.4.1 Thomas Hobbes 85
      3.2.4.2 John Locke 88
      3.2.4.3 Rousseau 90
  3.3 Revival of Natural Law 92
      3.3.1 H.L.A Hart: Minimum Content of Natural Law 93
4. **Command Theory of Legal Positivism and Hukum Shar'i**

A Comparative Assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Command Theory</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Early Development of Command Theory</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Bentham's Positivism/Utilitarianism</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Austin's Theory</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5.1</td>
<td>Criticism by Salmond</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5.2</td>
<td>Criticism by HLA Hart</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>Bentham and Austin Compared</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>The Shar'ib Concept of Hukum (Hukum Shar'i)</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7.1</td>
<td>Classification of Hukum</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7.2</td>
<td>Defining Rule (Al-Hukum Al-Taklifi)</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7.3</td>
<td>Obligation (Al-Jabli)</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7.4</td>
<td>Recommendation (Al-Nadli)</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7.5</td>
<td>Prohibition (Al-Tahrimi)</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7.6</td>
<td>Reprehension (Al-Karabali)</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7.7</td>
<td>Permission (Al-Ibali)</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. Law and Morality: A Comparative Appraisal

5.1 Introduction

5.2 Relationships
   5.2.1 Morality as the Basis of Law
   5.2.2 Morality as the Test of Law
   5.2.3 Morality as the End of Law

5.3 Law and Morality: Fuller

5.4 Law and Morality: Homosexuality and Same-Sex Marriage
   5.4.1 Homosexuality
   5.4.2 Artificial Insemination and use of Frozen Eggs

5.5 Legislatures and Morality

5.6 Judicial Solicitude: National Level

5.7 Other Contemporary Moral Issues

5.8 Islamic Morality
   5.8.1 General
   5.8.2 Categories of Men
   5.8.3 Basis of Morality: Intention
   5.8.4 Wrong Committed to Allah and Wrong to Man
   5.8.5 Public Morality and Private Morality
   5.8.6 Guardian of Morality
   5.8.7 A Wider Concept

5.9 The Qur'an
5.10 The Sunnah
5.11 Comparison
5.12 Conclusion
References


6.1 Introduction
6.2 Various Conceptions of Justice
6.2.1 David Hume
6.2.2 Aristotle
6.2.3 Procedural Justice and Substantive Justice
6.2.4 Jeremy Bentham
6.2.5 Social Contract Theorists
6.2.6 Karl Marx
6.2.7 Salmond
6.2.8 Dias: Five Tasks Justice
6.2.9 John Rawls: 'Justice as Fairness'
   6.2.9.1 Original Position
   6.2.9.2 Principles of Justice
   6.2.9.3 Criticism
   6.2.9.4 Overlapping Consensus
6.2.10 Robert Nozick
   6.2.10.1 Criticism
6.3 Public Interest Litigations and Procedural Justice
6.4 Justice Delayed Is Justice Denied
6.5 Islamic Perspective Of Justice
   6.5.1 General
   6.5.2 Social Justice
   6.5.3 Economic Justice
   6.5.4 Legal and Procedural Justice
   6.5.5 Cardinal Points
6.6 Comparison
6.7 Conclusion
References
# Comparative Jurisprudence

## 7. Rights and Duties in Civil Law and the Shari’ah: 229-251

**A Comparative Appraisal**

### 7.1 Introduction

### 7.2 Position in Western Jurisprudence

- 7.2.1 Nature of Rights
  - 7.2.1.1 Austin
  - 7.2.1.2 Jhering
  - 7.2.1.3 Salmond
  - 7.2.1.4 Gray
  - 7.2.1.5 Holland

- 7.2.2 Characteristics of a Right

- 7.2.3 Theories of Rights

- 7.2.4 Hohfeld's Jural Relations

- 7.2.5 Rights and Duties: Relationship

- 7.2.6 Kinds of Legal Rights

### 7.3 Position in Islamic Jurisprudence

- 7.3.1 Right (Haqq)
  - 7.3.1.1 General
  - 7.3.1.2 The Literal Meaning of Right
  - 7.3.1.3 The Legal Meaning of Right
  - 7.3.1.4 The Juridical Definition of a Right

- 7.3.2 Contemporary Approach

- 7.3.3 Duty

### 7.4 Conclusion

References

## 8. Custom as a Source of Law in the Contemporary World: 252-267

**A Comparative Exposition**

### 8.1 Introduction

### 8.2 Position of Custom in Western Jurisprudence

- 8.2.1 General

- 8.2.2 Conventional Customs

- 8.2.3 Local Custom

- 8.2.4 Custom as Law

- 8.2.5 Custom and Prescription
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.3 Position of Custom in Islamic Law</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.1 Conceptual Aspects and Importance</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.2 Justification (Hujjyyah)</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.3 Comparison with Tradition (Adab, Plural, Adab) and Consensus (Ijmā')</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.4 Requirement of ‘Urf</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4 Comparison</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5 Conclusion</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

9. Judicial Precedents: An Expository Study of Civil Judicial System and *Shari'ah* Court System

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.1 Introduction</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2 Judicial Precedents in Civil Law</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3 Judicial Precedents: Advantages and Disadvantages</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4 Circumstances that Destroy or Weaken the Binding Force of Precedents</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5 Circumstances that Increase or Decrease the Authority of Precedents</td>
<td>279</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6 Stare Decisis in Some Countries</td>
<td>279</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6.1 Malaysian Position</td>
<td>279</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6.2 Indian Position</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.7 Ratio Decidendi</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.7.1 Meaning</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.7.2 Methods to Determine <em>Ratio</em></td>
<td>282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.8 Do Judges Make Law?</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.8.1 Declaratory Theory</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.8.2 Judges do Make Law</td>
<td>285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.9 Judicial Precedents in the <em>Shari'ah</em> and State Practices</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.9.1 <em>Shari'ah</em> Position</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.9.1.1 Qadi</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.9.1.2 Hierarchy of Courts</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.9.1.3 Doctrine of Judicial Precedent</td>
<td>289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.9.2 State Practice</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.9.2.1 Malaysian Position</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

10.1 Introduction 298
10.2 Possession 298
  10.2.1 The Concept of Possession 298
  10.2.2 Reasons for Protecting Possession 300
  10.2.3 Savigny's Theory of Possession 302
  10.2.4 Possession in Fact 302
  10.2.5 Possession in Law 303
  10.2.6 Possessory Remedies 307
10.3 Ownership 309
  10.3.1 Absolute Ownership 310
  10.3.2 Meaning and Scope of Ownership 310
  10.3.3 Acquisition of Ownership 314
  10.3.4 Sole Ownership and Co-ownership 314
  10.3.5 Trust and Beneficial Ownership 315
  10.3.6 Vested Ownership and Contingent Ownership 316
  10.3.7 Legal and Equitable Ownership 317
10.4 Islamic Perspective of Possession and Ownership 319
  10.4.1 Property 319
  10.4.2 Ownership 320
    10.4.2.1 Types of Ownership 320
    10.4.2.2 Modes of Acquiring Ownership 322
    10.4.2.3 Acquiring Ownership in Res Nullius/ Terra Nullius 322
    10.4.2.4 “Finders Keepers” 323
    10.4.2.5 Religious Limitations on Ownership 324
10.5 Possession 326
10.6 Comparative Assessment 327
10.7 Conclusion 328

References 328
## 11. A Comparative Exposition of Feminist Jurisprudence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>Historical Perspective of the Development of Feminist--</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jurisprudence in the West</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3</td>
<td>Various Strands of the Feminist Movement</td>
<td>341</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>Common Issues</td>
<td>341</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11.4.1 Oppression</td>
<td>341</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10.4.2 Patriarchy</td>
<td>342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10.4.3 Exploitation of Women</td>
<td>345</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10.4.4 Equality or Equity</td>
<td>346</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11.4.5 The Issue of Justice</td>
<td>352</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.5</td>
<td>Feminist Methodology</td>
<td>354</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.6</td>
<td>Contemporary Issues</td>
<td>355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11.6.1 General</td>
<td>355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11.6.2 Sexual Harassment at the Place of Work</td>
<td>356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11.6.3 Issues Pertaining to LBGT</td>
<td>359</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11.6.4 Pornography</td>
<td>360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11.6.5 Rape</td>
<td>361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11.6.6 Domestic Violence</td>
<td>363</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11.6.7 So-Called ‘Honour Killings’</td>
<td>365</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11.6.8 Neutrality in Decision-Making</td>
<td>365</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11.6.9 Abortion</td>
<td>366</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11.6.10 Dowry: Paid by Wife to Husband</td>
<td>367</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11.6.11 Child Marriage</td>
<td>368</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11.6.12 Prostitution</td>
<td>370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.7</td>
<td>Status of Women in Islam</td>
<td>373</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11.7.1 General</td>
<td>373</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.8</td>
<td>Social and Educational Affairs</td>
<td>375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11.8.1 Right to Property</td>
<td>377</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11.8.2 Right to Work</td>
<td>378</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11.8.3 Hospitality</td>
<td>379</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11.8.4 Child Marriage</td>
<td>379</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11.8.5 Newborn Abandoned Children</td>
<td>380</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>Political Affairs</td>
<td>382</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.10</td>
<td>Marriage/Dower</td>
<td>383</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
11.11 Contemporary Issues
  11.11.1 Reproductive Rights 385
  11.11.2 Conjugal Rights 390
  11.11.3 Rights of Hermaphrodites (Khunthai) 391
  11.11.4 Family Violence 391
  11.11.5 Women as Judges 393
  11.11.6 Registration of Muslim Marriage 395
  11.11.7 Family Law Reforms 396

11.12 International Law 397

11.13 Comparison: Conclusion 398

References 402

12. Jurisprudence in Third World Countries: ........................................... 405-473
A Critical Exposition with Special Reference to Muslim Countries

12.1 Introduction 405

12.2 Nature and Scope of Jurisprudence in Third World Countries 407

12.3 Relevance of Various Traditional Legal Theories 411
  12.3.1 Natural Law Theories 411
  12.3.2 Positive Law Theories 412
  12.3.3 Historical and Anthropological Theories 414
  12.3.4 Economic Theory 415
  12.3.5 Sociological Approach 416
  12.3.6 Realism 417

12.4 Constitution and its Amendment 419

12.5 Form of Government: Demand for Democracy 423

12.6 Judicial Independence 427

12.7 Distributive Justice 433

12.8 Land Reforms 438

12.9 Law and Social Control 447
  12.9.1 Informal and Formal Social Control 447
  12.9.2 Death Penalty 453
  12.9.3 Crimes without Victims 455
  10.9.4 Commercial Crimes 460
  12.9.5 Premarital Sex 463
12.10 Law and Social Change
12.10.1 Theoretical Aspect 465
12.10.2 Relationship between Social Changes and Legal Changes 467
12.11 Conclusion 470
References 472

13. Contemporary Jurisprudential Issues in Terrorism and their Islamic Perspectives: A Comparative Assessment 474-535

13.1 Introduction 474
13.2 To Have a Viable Definition 479
13.2.1 General or Specific Definitions 482
13.2.2 Judicial Solicitude 483
13.2.3 Objects 485
13.2.4 Individual Terrorist 486
13.2.5 Means 487
13.2.6 State Terrorism 488
13.2.7 Pre-Emptive Strikes Are Encouraging Terrorism 492
13.2.8 Self-Determination and Terrorism 496
13.2.9 International Terrorism 497
13.3 Terrorism and Islam 499
13.3.1 Islam is Against Terrorism 499
13.3.2 Madinas Are for Religious Teachings 502
13.3.3 Terrorists Are Not Martyrs 503
13.4 Prisoners of War 503
13.4.1 Taking Prisoners of War 503
13.4.2 Illegal Detentions (POWs) 505
13.4.3 Torture to Prisoners 511
13.4.4 Denial of Procedural Justice 516
13.5 Conclusion 524
References 529

Bibliography 536-569

Index 570-575