

Document details

[< Back to results](#) | 1 of 1[Export](#) [Download](#) [Print](#) [E-mail](#) [Save to PDF](#) [Add to List](#) [More... >](#)[Full Text](#) [View at Publisher](#)Molecules [Open Access](#)

Volume 23, Issue 9, 28 August 2018, Article number 2160

Classification of raw stingless bee honeys by bee species origins using the NMR - and LC-MS-based metabolomics approach (Article)

[\(Open Access\)](#)Razali, M.T.A.^a [✉](#), Zainal, Z.A.^a [✉](#), Maulidiani, M.^a [✉](#), Shaari, K.^a [✉](#), Zamri, Z.^b [✉](#), Idrus, M.Z.M.^b [✉](#), Khatib, A.^c [✉](#), Abas, F.^a [✉](#), Ling, Y.S.^d [✉](#), Rui, L.L.^d [✉](#), Ismail, I.S.^a [✉](#) [👤](#)^aLaboratory of Natural Products, Institute of Bioscience, Universiti Putra Malaysia, Serdang, Selangor, 43400, Malaysia^bSyamille Agrofarm and Resort Sdn. Bhd., Kampung Chuar Hulu, Mukim Chegar Galah, Lot 3749 & 3750, Jalan Lata Perahu, Kati, Kuala Kangsar, Perak 33020, Malaysia^cDepartment of Pharmaceutical Chemistry, Kulliyah of Pharmacy, International Islamic University Malaysia (IIUM), Jalan Sultan Ahmad Shah, Bandar Indera Mahkota, Kuantan, Pahang 25200, Malaysia[View additional affiliations](#) [v](#)

Abstract

[v View references \(44\)](#)

The official standard for quality control of honey is currently based on physicochemical properties. However, this method is time-consuming, cost intensive, and does not lead to information on the originality of honey. This study aims to classify raw stingless bee honeys by bee species origins as a potential classifier using the NMR - LCMS-based metabolomics approach. Raw stingless bee honeys were analysed and classified by bee species origins using proton nuclear magnetic resonance (¹H- NMR) spectroscopy and an ultra-high performance liquid chromatography-quadrupole time of flight mass spectrometry (UHPLC-QTOF MS) in combination with chemometrics tools. The honey samples were able to be classified into three different groups based on the bee species origins of *Heterotrigona itama*, *Geniotrigona thoracica*, and *Tetrigona apicalis*. D-Fructofuranose (*H. itama* honey), β-D-Glucose, D-Xylose, α-D-Glucose (*G. thoracica* honey), and L-Lactic acid, Acetic acid, L-Alanine (*T. apicalis* honey) identified D-Fructofuranose identified via ¹H- NMR data and the diagnostic ions of UHPLC-QTOF MS were characterized as the discriminant metabolites or putative chemical markers. It could be suggested that the quality of honey in terms of originality and purity can be rapidly determined using the classification technique by bee species origins via the ¹H- NMR - and UHPLC-QTOF MS-based metabolomics approach. © 2018 by the authors.

SciVal Topic Prominence [ⓘ](#)

Topic: Honey | Bees | botanical origin

Prominence percentile: 98.680 [ⓘ](#)

Author keywords

[Bee species origins](#) [Chemometrics](#) [Classification](#) [LC-MS](#) [Metabolomics](#) [NMR](#)
[Stingless bee honey](#)

Funding details

Funding number	Funding sponsor	Acronym	Funding opportunities
07-02-14-1584FR	Ministry of Higher Education, Malaysia	MOHE	

Metrics [?](#)

0 Citations in Scopus
 0 Field-Weighted Citation Impact

PlumX Metrics [v](#)

Usage, Captures, Mentions, Social Media and Citations beyond Scopus.

Cited by 0 documents

Inform me when this document is cited in Scopus:

[Set citation alert >](#)[Set citation feed >](#)

Related documents

Entomological authentication of stingless bee honey by ¹H NMR-based metabolomics approachZuccato, V. , Finotello, C. , Menegazzo, I. (2017) *Food Control*

Nuclear magnetic resonance as a method to predict the geographical and entomological origin of pot-honey

Schievano, E. , Mammi, S. , Menegazzo, I. (2012) *Pot-Honey: A Legacy of Stingless Bees*

1H nuclear magnetic resonance spectra of chloroform extracts of honey for chemometric determination of its botanical origin

Schievano, E. , Peggion, E. , Mammi, S. (2010) *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*[View all related documents based on references](#)

Funding number	Funding sponsor	Acronym	Funding opportunities	Find more related documents in Scopus based on:
07-02-14-1584FR	Ministry of Higher Education, Malaysia	MOHE		Authors > Keywords >
07-02-14-1584FR	Ministry of Higher Education, Malaysia	MOHE		
07-02-14-1584FR	Ministry of Higher Education, Malaysia	MOHE		

Funding text #1

Funding: This research received Fundamental Research Grant Scheme (Project No. 07-02-14-1584FR) from the Ministry of Higher Education (MOHE), Malaysia.

Funding text #2



Acknowledgments: The authors wish to acknowledge the Ministry of Higher Education (MOHE), Malaysia for financial support under the Fundamental Research Grant Scheme (Project No. 07-02-14-1584FR).

ISSN: 14203049
CODEN: MOLEF
Source Type: Journal
Original language: English

DOI: 10.3390/molecules23092160
Document Type: Article
Publisher: MDPI AG

References (44)

[View in search results format >](#)

All [Export](#)  Print  E-mail [Save to PDF](#) [Create bibliography](#)

- 1 (2001) *Standard for Honey Codex Stan 12-1981, 12Codex Stan 1-8*
Available online: accessed on 1 August 2018
[Codex Alimentarius Commission](#)

- 2 Vit, P., Oddo, L.P., Marano, M.L., De Mejias, E.S.
Venezuelan stingless bee honeys characterized by multivariate analysis of physicochemical properties
(1998) *Apidologie*, 29 (5), pp. 377-389. Cited 37 times.
<http://www.springerlink.com/content/0044-8435/>
doi: 10.1051/apido:19980501

[View at Publisher](#)

- 3 Vit, P., Medina, M., Enríquez, M.E.
Quality standards for medicinal uses of Meliponinae honey in Guatemala, Mexico and Venezuela
(2004) *Bee World*, 85 (1), pp. 2-5. Cited 76 times.
http://www.ibra.org.uk/categories/bee_world
doi: 10.1080/0005772X.2004.11099603

[View at Publisher](#)

- 4 Jandrić, Z., Haughey, S.A., Frew, R.D., McComb, K., Galvin-King, P., Elliott, C.T., Cannavan, A.
Discrimination of honey of different floral origins by a combination of various chemical parameters

(2015) *Food Chemistry*, 189, art. no. 17094, pp. 52-59. Cited 21 times.

www.elsevier.com/locate/foodchem

doi: 10.1016/j.foodchem.2014.11.165

[View at Publisher](#)

- 5 Leeder, J.
Honey Laundering: The Sour Side of Nature'S Golden Sweetener
Available online: accessed on 5 January 2011
<https://www.theglobeandmail.com/technology/science/honey-laundering-the-sour-side-ofnatures-golden-sweetener/article562759/>

- 6 Bogdanov, S., Vit, P., Kilchenmann, V.
Sugar profiles and conductivity of stingless bee honeys from Venezuela

(1996) *Apidologie*, 27 (6), pp. 445-450. Cited 25 times.

<http://www.springerlink.com/content/0044-8435/>

doi: 10.1051/apido:19960602

[View at Publisher](#)

- 7 Mateo, R., Bosch-Reig, F.
Sugar profiles of Spanish unifloral honeys
(1997) *Food Chemistry*, 60 (1), pp. 33-41. Cited 94 times.
doi: 10.1016/S0308-8146(96)00297-X

[View at Publisher](#)

- 8 Vit, P., Sancho, T., Pascual, A., Deliza, R.
Sensory perception of tropical pot honeys by Spanish consumers, using free choice profile
(2011) *J. ApiProd. ApiMed. Sci.*, 3, pp. 174-180. Cited 8 times.

- 9 Aboud, F., De Pasquale, C., Sinacori, A., Massi, S., Conte, P., Alonzo, G.
Palynological, physico-chemical and aroma characterization of Sicilian honeys
(2011) *J. ApiProd. ApiMed. Sci.*, 3, pp. 164-173. Cited 2 times.

- 10 De Almeida-Muradian, L.B., Matsuda, A.H., Bastos, D.H.M.
Physicochemical parameters of Amazon Melipona honey

(2007) *Quimica Nova*, 30 (3), pp. 707-708. Cited 23 times.

<http://www.scielo.br/pdf/qn/v30n3/32.pdf>

[View at Publisher](#)

- 11 Arvanitoyannis, I.S., Chalhoub, C., Gotsiou, P., Lydakis-Simantiris, N., Kefalas, P.
Novel quality control methods in conjunction with chemometrics (multivariate analysis) for detecting honey authenticity

(2005) *Critical Reviews in Food Science and Nutrition*, 45 (3), pp. 193-203. Cited 118 times.

doi: 10.1080/10408690590956369

[View at Publisher](#)

- 12 Karabagias, I.K., Badeka, A.V., Kontakos, S., Karabournioti, S., Kontominas, M.G.
Botanical discrimination of Greek unifloral honeys with physico-chemical and chemometric analyses

(2014) *Food Chemistry*, 165, pp. 181-190. Cited 34 times.
www.elsevier.com/locate/foodchem
doi: 10.1016/j.foodchem.2014.05.033

View at Publisher
-
- 13 Pucciarelli, A.B., Schapovaloff, M.E., Kummritz, S.K., Seňuk, I.A., Brumovsky, L.A., Dallagnol, A.M.
Microbiological and physicochemical analysis of yateí (*Tetragonisca angustula*) honey for assessing quality standards and commercialization (Open Access)

(2014) *Revista Argentina de Microbiologia*, 46 (4), pp. 325-332. Cited 6 times.
<http://www.aam.org.ar/src/download.php?adjunto=04012015.8.pdf>
doi: 10.1016/S0325-7541(14)70091-4

View at Publisher
-
- 14 Serrano, S., Villarejo, M., Espejo, R., Jodral, M.
Chemical and physical parameters of Andalusian honey: Classification of Citrus and Eucalyptus honeys by discriminant analysis

(2004) *Food Chemistry*, 87 (4), pp. 619-625. Cited 90 times.
doi: 10.1016/j.foodchem.2004.01.031

View at Publisher
-
- 15 Silva, T.M.S., dos Santos, F.P., Evangelista-Rodrigues, A., da Silva, E.M.S., da Silva, G.S., de Novais, J.S., dos Santos, F.D.A.R., (...), Camara, C.A.
Phenolic compounds, melissopalynological, physicochemical analysis and antioxidant activity of jandaíra (*Melipona subnitida*) honey (Open Access)

(2013) *Journal of Food Composition and Analysis*, 29 (1), pp. 10-18. Cited 58 times.
doi: 10.1016/j.jfca.2012.08.010

View at Publisher
-
- 16 de Almeida-Muradian, L.B., Stramm, K.M., Estevinho, L.M.
Efficiency of the FT-IR ATR spectrometry for the prediction of the physicochemical characteristics of *Melipona subnitida* honey and study of the temperature's effect on those properties

(2014) *International Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 49 (1), pp. 188-195. Cited 12 times.
doi: 10.1111/ijfs.12297

View at Publisher
-
- 17 Guerrini, A., Bruni, R., Maietti, S., Poli, F., Rossi, D., Paganetto, G., Muzzoli, M., (...), Sacchetti, G.
Ecuadorian stingless bee (*Meliponinae*) honey: A chemical and functional profile of an ancient health product

(2009) *Food Chemistry*, 114 (4), pp. 1413-1420. Cited 59 times.
doi: 10.1016/j.foodchem.2008.11.023

View at Publisher
-

- 18 Anklam, E.
A review of the analytical methods to determine the geographical and botanical origin of honey
(1998) *Food Chemistry*, 63 (4), pp. 549-562. Cited 507 times.
doi: 10.1016/S0308-8146(98)00057-0
[View at Publisher](#)
-
- 19 Hall, R.D.
Plant metabolomics: From holistic hope, to hype, to hot topic
(2006) *New Phytologist*, 169 (3), pp. 453-468. Cited 281 times.
doi: 10.1111/j.1469-8137.2005.01632.x
[View at Publisher](#)
-
- 20 Kuballa, T., Brunner, T.S., Thongpanchang, T., Walch, S.G., Lachenmeier, D.W.
Application of NMR for authentication of honey, beer and spices
(2018) *Current Opinion in Food Science*, 19, pp. 57-62. Cited 3 times.
<http://www.journals.elsevier.com/current-opinion-in-food-science/>
doi: 10.1016/j.cofs.2018.01.007
[View at Publisher](#)
-
- 21 Beretta, G., Caneva, E., Regazzoni, L., Bakhtyari, N.G., Maffei Facino, R.
A solid-phase extraction procedure coupled to 1H NMR, with chemometric analysis, to seek reliable markers of the botanical origin of honey
(2008) *Analytica Chimica Acta*, 620 (1-2), pp. 176-182. Cited 34 times.
doi: 10.1016/j.aca.2008.05.025
[View at Publisher](#)
-
- 22 Etzold, E., Lichtenberg-Kraag, B.
Determination of the botanical origin of honey by Fourier-transformed infrared spectroscopy: An approach for routine analysis
(2008) *European Food Research and Technology*, 227 (2), pp. 579-586. Cited 41 times.
doi: 10.1007/s00217-007-0759-9
[View at Publisher](#)
-
- 23 Jandrić, Z., Frew, R.D., Fernandez-Cedi, L.N., Cannavan, A.
An investigative study on discrimination of honey of various floral and geographical origins using UPLC-QToF MS and multivariate data analysis
(2017) *Food Control*, Part B 72, pp. 189-197. Cited 8 times.
doi: 10.1016/j.foodcont.2015.10.010
[View at Publisher](#)
-
- 24 Lolli, M., Bertelli, D., Plessi, M., Sabatini, A.G., Restani, C.
Classification of Italian honeys by 2D HR-NMR
(2008) *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 56 (4), pp. 1298-1304. Cited 46 times.
doi: 10.1021/jf072763c
[View at Publisher](#)
-

- 25 Ohmenhaeuser, M., Monakhova, Y.B., Kuballa, T., Lachenmeier, D.W.
Qualitative and quantitative control of honeys using NMR spectroscopy and chemometrics
(2013) *ISRN Anal. Chem.*, 2013, pp. 1-9. Cited 20 times.
-
- 26 Schievano, E., Peggion, E., Mammi, S.
1H nuclear magnetic resonance spectra of chloroform extracts of honey for chemometric determination of its botanical origin
(2010) *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 58 (1), pp. 57-65. Cited 56 times.
<http://pubs.acs.org/doi/pdfplus/10.1021/jf9022977>
doi: 10.1021/jf9022977

View at Publisher
-
- 27 Zhou, J., Yao, L., Li, Y., Chen, L., Wu, L., Zhao, J.
Floral classification of honey using liquid chromatography-diode array detection-tandem mass spectrometry and chemometric analysis
(2014) *Food Chemistry*, 145, pp. 941-949. Cited 37 times.
doi: 10.1016/j.foodchem.2013.08.117

View at Publisher
-
- 28 Consonni, R., Cagliani, L.R.
Geographical characterization of polyfloral and acacia honeys by nuclear magnetic resonance and chemometrics
(2008) *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 56 (16), pp. 6873-6880. Cited 56 times.
doi: 10.1021/jf801332r

View at Publisher
-
- 29 Donarski, J.A., Jones, S.A., Charlton, A.J.
Application of cryoprobe 1H nuclear magnetic resonance spectroscopy and multivariate analysis for the verification of corsican honey
(2008) *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 56 (14), pp. 5451-5456. Cited 50 times.
doi: 10.1021/jf072402x

View at Publisher
-
- 30 Vit, P., Fernandez-Maeso, M.C., Ortiz-Valbuena, A.
Potential use of the three frequently occurring sugars in honey to predict stingless bee entomological origin
(1998) *Journal of Applied Entomology*, 122 (1), pp. 5-8. Cited 15 times.
<http://www.wiley.com/bw/editors.asp?ref=0931-2048&site=1>
doi: 10.1111/j.1439-0418.1998.tb01452.x

View at Publisher
-
- 31 Ramón-Sierra, J.M., Ruiz-Ruiz, J.C., De La Luz Ortiz-Vázquez, E.
Electrophoresis characterisation of protein as a method to establish the entomological origin of stingless bee honeys
(2015) *Food Chemistry*, 183, pp. 43-48. Cited 16 times.
www.elsevier.com/locate/foodchem
doi: 10.1016/j.foodchem.2015.03.015

View at Publisher
-

- 32 Kek, S.P., Chin, N.L., Tan, S.W., Yusof, Y.A., Chua, L.S.
Classification of Honey from Its Bee Origin via Chemical Profiles and Mineral Content

(2017) *Food Analytical Methods*, 10 (1), pp. 19-30. Cited 12 times.
<http://www.springer.com/life+sci/food+science/journal/12161>
doi: 10.1007/s12161-016-0544-0

[View at Publisher](#)

- 33 Vit, P., Soler, C., Tomás-Barberán, F.A.
Profiles of phenolic compounds of *Apis mellifera* and *Melipona* spp. honeys from Venezuela

(1997) *Zeitschrift für Lebensmittel -Untersuchung und -Forschung*, 204 (1), pp. 43-47. Cited 20 times.

[View at Publisher](#)

- 34 Kim, H.K., Choi, Y.H., Verpoorte, R.
NMR-based metabolomic analysis of plants

(2010) *Nature Protocols*, 5 (3), pp. 536-549. Cited 369 times.
doi: 10.1038/nprot.2009.237

[View at Publisher](#)

- 35 Katajamaa, M., Miettinen, J., Orešič, M.
MZmine: Toolbox for processing and visualization of mass spectrometry based molecular profile data

(2006) *Bioinformatics*, 22 (5), pp. 634-636. Cited 446 times.
doi: 10.1093/bioinformatics/btk039

[View at Publisher](#)

- 36 Sawaya, A.C.H.F., Cunha, I.B.D.S., Marcucci, M.C., Aidar, D.S., Silva, E.C.A., Carvalho, C.A.L., Eberlin, M.N.
Electrospray ionization mass spectrometry fingerprinting of propolis of native Brazilian stingless bees

(2007) *Apidologie*, 38 (1), pp. 93-103. Cited 16 times.
<http://www.edpsciences.org/articles/apido/pdf/2007/01/m6066.pdf?access=ok>
doi: 10.1051/apido:2006058

[View at Publisher](#)

- 37 Eriksson, L., Johansson, E., Kettaneh-Wold, N., Trygg, J., Wikstrom, C., Wold, S.
(2006) *Multi- and Megavariate Data Analysis: Part I: Basic Principles and Applications*. Cited 1115 times.
Umetrics AB: Umea, Sweden

- 38 Jalil, A.H., Shuib, I.
(2014) *Beescape for Meliponines: Conservation of Indo-Malayan Stingless Bees*, pp. 13-212. Cited 6 times.
Partridge: Singapore

- 39 Bogdanov, S., Lullmann, C., Mossel, B.L., D'Arcy, B.R., Russmann, H., Vorwohl, G., Oddo, L., (...), Piro, R.
Honey quality, methods of analysis and international regulatory standards: Review of the work of the international honey commission
(1999) *Mitt. Lebensm. Hyg.*, 90, pp. 108-125. Cited 65 times.

□ 40 Vit, P., Pedro, S.R.M., Roubik, D.W.
Pot-honey a legacy of stingless bees
(2013) *Pot-Honey: A Legacy of Stingless Bees*, pp. 3-654. Cited 27 times.
Springer: New York, NY, USA

□ 41 Boffo, E.F., Tavares, L.A., Tobias, A.C.T., Ferreira, M.M.C., Ferreira, A.G.
Identification of components of Brazilian honey by ¹H NMR and classification of its botanical origin by chemometric methods ([Open Access](#))

(2012) *LWT - Food Science and Technology*, 49 (1), pp. 55-63. Cited 40 times.
doi: 10.1016/j.lwt.2012.04.024

[View at Publisher](#)

□ 42 Zhu, Z.-J., Schultz, A.W., Wang, J., Johnson, C.H., Yannone, S.M., Patti, G.J., Siuzdak, G.
Liquid chromatography quadrupole time-of-flight mass spectrometry characterization of metabolites guided by the METLIN database

(2013) *Nature Protocols*, 8 (3), pp. 451-460. Cited 150 times.
doi: 10.1038/nprot.2013.004

[View at Publisher](#)

□ 43 Schwarz, H.F.
The indo-malayan species of trigona
(1939) *Bulletin of The American Museum of Natural History*, pp. 83-141. Cited 44 times.
LXXVI(Art. III); The American Museum of Natural History: New York, NY, USA

□ 44 Rasmussen, C.
Catalog of the Indo-Malayan/Australasian stingless bees (Hymenoptera: Apidae: Meliponini)

(2008) *Zootaxa*, (1935), pp. 1-80. Cited 28 times.

🔍 Ismail, I.S.; Laboratory of Natural Products, Institute of Bioscience, Universiti Putra Malaysia, Serdang, Selangor, Malaysia; email:safinar@upm.edu.my

© Copyright 2018 Elsevier B.V., All rights reserved.

[< Back to results](#) | 1 of 1

[^ Top of page](#)

About Scopus

[What is Scopus](#)
[Content coverage](#)
[Scopus blog](#)
[Scopus API](#)
[Privacy matters](#)

Language

[日本語に切り替える](#)
[切换到简体中文](#)
[切换到繁體中文](#)
[Русский язык](#)

Customer Service

[Help](#)
[Contact us](#)

Copyright © 2018 Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved. Scopus® is a registered trademark of Elsevier B.V.
We use cookies to help provide and enhance our service and tailor content. By continuing, you agree to the use of cookies.