The CENTRAL ISSUE in the RAPE TRIAL

MOHAMAD ISMAIL MOHAMD YUNUS
The CENTRAL ISSUE in the
RAPE TRIAL

Mohamad Ismail Mohamad Yunus

IIUM Press
Gombak • 2015
©IIUM Press, IIUM

IIUM Press is a member of the Majlis Penerbitan Ilmiah Malaysia – MAPIM
(Malaysian Scholarly Publishing Council)

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced,
stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means,
electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise,
without any prior written permission of the publisher.

Perpustakaan Negara Malaysia

Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

Mohamad Ismail Hj. Mohamad Yunus
The Central in the Rape Trial / Mohamad Ismail
Mohamad Yunus, Ph.D.
1. Rape--Law and legislation--Malaysia. I. Title.
345.59502532

Published by
IIUM Press
International Islamic University Malaysia
P.O. Box 10, 50728 Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia

Printed in Malaysia by
Contents

Table of Cases ix
List of Abbreviation of Journals/Articles/Periodicals xv
Foreword xix
Preface xxi
Introduction xxiii

Chapter 1
The Concepts of “Against Her Will” and “Without Her Consent” 1
Statutory Provisions from Various Common Law Jurisdictions 4
The Principle of Mens Rea in the Malaysian Penal Code 4
The Background to Reforming the Mens Rea for Rape in England 8
Absence of Consent 12
The Offence of Rape in India 16
The Application of Consent and Accountability in Rape in Singapore 21
The Offence of Rape in Singapore 22
Meaning of Consent 23
Difference between Consent and Submission 24
Meaning of Consent under the Penal Code of Malaysia 26
Studies on How the Courts Determine Consent 27
The Essentaility of Resistance in Consent 28
Various Jurisdiction Approach in Determined Consent 37
Proposal of the Amendment of Rape Law by the Law Commission of India 57
Conclusion 76
 Provisional Proposal to the Malaysian Penal Code 78
## Contents

### Chapter 2  Vitiation of Consent

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Factors That Vitiate Consent</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Scope of Fraud Vitiates Consent</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fraud as to the Nature and Quality of the Act</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical Treatment</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transmission of Venereal Disease or Virus</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miscellaneous Fraud as to the Nature and Quality of the Act</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impersonation or Fraud as to the Identity of Other Person</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provisional Proposal to the Malaysian Penal Code</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Chapter 3  Incapacity to Consent

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Consent Given by Minors and Young Persons</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consent of Persons Who Lack Intellectual Capacity</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consent while in the State of Insensibility or Unconsciousness</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provisional Proposal to the Malaysian Penal Code</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incapacity to Consent</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meaning of Incapacity</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Chapter 4  Vitiation of Consent by Threats or Fear

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Threat or Fear of Bodily Harm</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Threat of Harm to a Third Party</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Threat or Fear Induced by a Third Party</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immediacy of Threat</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reasonableness of the Threats</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Threat or Fear of Non-Bodily Harm and Other Pressures</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexual Exploitation</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Pressure</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

Threat of Unlawful Detention or Malicious Prosecution 252
Sexual Blackmail 253
Statutory Provisions on Threat or Fear and Other Pressures 257
Conclusion 293
Provisional Proposal to the Malaysian Penal Code 296
Inducing Sexual Intercourse by Threats of Bodily Harm 296
Inducing Sexual Intercourse by Threats of Non-Bodily Harm and Other Pressures 296

Chapter 5 The Legal Status of Consent to Sexual Intercourse: An Islamic Dimension 298
Introduction 298
Definition of Rape under Islamic Law and Malaysian Law 302
The Physical Elements of Rape under Islamic Law and Malaysian Law 310
The Act of Sexual Intercourse 310
The Absence of Consent 312
Factors Vitiating Consent According to Islamic Law 314
Incapacity Negates Consent 314
Fraud (khi'd'a) or Mistake (khat'a') Negates Consent 316
Coercion (Ikrāh) Negates Consent 318
Evidence in Rape under Islamic Law and Malaysian Law 321
Conclusion 326

Bibliography 329
Index 343