



Mediation in Malaysia: The Law and Practice

Mohammad Naqib Ishan Jan
Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed

MEDIATION IN MALAYSIA: THE LAW AND PRACTICE

MOHAMMAD NAQIB ISHAN JAN

LLB (HONS) (IIUM), MCL (IIUM)

PHD (IIUM)

HEAD OF RESEARCH MANAGEMENT UNIT (AIKOL)

ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR,

AHMAD IBRAHIM KULLIYAH OF LAWS (AIKOL)

INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY MALAYSIA (IIUM)

ASHGAR ALI ALI MOHAMED

LLB (HONS), MCL (IIUM)

LLM (HONS) (NZ), PHD (BUSINESS LAW)

ADVOCATE AND SOLICITOR (NON-PRACTISING)

ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR

AHMAD IBRAHIM KULLIYAH OF LAWS (AIKOL)

INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY MALAYSIA (IIUM)

MEMBERS OF THE LEXISNEXIS GROUP WORLDWIDE

Malaysia	LexisNexis Malaysia Sdn Bhd† (formerly known as Malayan Law Journal Sdn Bhd) T1-6, Jaya 33, 3 Jalan Semangat Seksyen 13, 46100 Petaling Jaya Selangor Darul Ehsan, MALAYSIA
Australia	LexisNexis Butterworths, Chatswood, NEW SOUTH WALES
Austria	LexisNexis Verlag ARD Orac GmbH & Co KG, VIENNA
Benelux	LexisNexis Benelux, AMSTERDAM
Canada	LexisNexis Canada, Markham, ONTARIO
China	LexisNexis China, BEIJING
France	LexisNexis SA, PARIS
Germany	LexisNexis Deutschland GmbH, MUNSTER
Hong Kong	LexisNexis Hong Kong, HONG KONG
India	LexisNexis Butterworths Wadhwa Nagpur, Gurgaon, HARYANA
Italy	Giuffre Editore, MILAN
Japan	LexisNexis Japan, TOKYO
New Zealand	LexisNexis NZ Ltd, WELLINGTON
Poland	Wydawnictwo Prawnicze LexisNexis Sp, WARSAW
Singapore	LexisNexis Singapore, SINGAPORE
South Africa	LexisNexis Butterworths, DURBAN
United Kingdom	LexisNexis Butterworths Tolley, LONDON and EDINBURGH
USA	LexisNexis Dayton, OHIO

©LexisNexis, a division of Reed Elsevier (Singapore) 2008 Pte Ltd
2010

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, including photocopying and recording, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher. Such written permission must also be obtained before any part of this publication is stored in a retrieval system of any nature.

The Publisher, authors, contributors and endorsers of this publication each excludes liability for loss suffered by any person resulting in any way from the use of, or reliance on this publication.

†Company No 76125-H
ISBN 978-967-5371-84-4



CONTENTS

<i>Authors' Profile</i>	vii
<i>Foreword</i>	xi
<i>Preface</i>	xiii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxxiii
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	li
<i>Table of Subsidiary Legislation</i>	lix
<i>Table of Foreign Legislation</i>	lxiii
<i>Table of Foreign Subsidiary Legislation</i>	lxv
<i>Table of Practice Directions</i>	lxvii
<i>Table of Conventions, Treaties etc</i>	lxix

PART I

Alternative Dispute Resolution: An Overview

Chapter 1

Alternative Dispute Resolution: Concept and Selected Processes

INTRODUCTION	1
THE CONCEPT OF ADR	2
SELECTED PROCESSES OF ADR.....	3
Negotiation.....	3
Mediation	5
Definition of Mediation.....	7
Types of Mediation	7
Elements of Mediation	9
The Scope of Application.....	13
Benefits of Mediation.....	13
Conciliation.....	14
Arbitration	15
THE LAW GOVERNING ARBITRATION IN MALAYSIA	16
Arbitration Agreement.....	17
Arbitrator	18
Appointment of Arbitrators.....	19

Arbitration proceeding	20
Arbitral Award	22
Conclusion	26

Chapter 2

Arbitration: Its Form and Process

INTRODUCTION	33
Arbitration	33
Arbitration agreement	35
Arbitrator	36
Appointment of an Arbitrator	37
Arbitration proceeding	38
Conclusion	47

PART II
Mediation: Its Merits

Chapter 3

Litigating Disputes in Court and its Demerits

LITIGATION: ADVERSARIAL AND HIGHLY STRUCTURED	52
DEMERITS OF LITIGATION	62
Conclusion	70

Chapter 4

Merits of Mediation

INTRODUCTION	77
The benefits of Mediation	79
Flexibility of process	80
Flexibility of outcome	80
Speedy and cheaper process	81
Private Setting	81
Preservation of relationship	82
Confidentiality	83
Impartiality	84
Settlement Agreement	84
Conclusion	85

**PART III
Mediation Centres**

Chapter 5

Various Centres Offering Mediation Services in Malaysia

INTRODUCTION 89

FINANCIAL MEDIATION BUREAU (FMB)..... 91

 General Observations 91

 The Complaints that may be Referred to FMB 92

 Procedure for Lodging of the Complaints 93

THE MALAYSIAN MEDIATION CENTRE (MMC)..... 96

 The Establishment of MMC 96

 Procedure for a Dispute to be Referred to MMC 97

 Mediation in MMC – a Future Direction..... 99

KUALA LUMPUR REGIONAL CENTRE FOR ARBITRATION
(KLRCA) 100

 General Overview of Its Establishment 100

 Mediation in KLRCA..... 101

 General Aspect of Mediation under the Rules for
 Conciliation/Mediation of the Regional
 Centre for Arbitration Kuala Lumpur 102

BIRO BANTUAN GUAMAN (BBG) 105

 General Observations 105

 Second Schedule (Section 10) – Description of
 Criminal Proceedings..... 106

 Third Schedule (Section 12) – Description of Civil
 Proceedings 107

 Conclusion..... 108

**PART IV
Mediation Agreement**

Chapter 6

**Debate on the Legal Enforceability of ADR Agreements
and what the Future Holds**

CONTOURS OF THIS DEBATE 113

STAND OF ENGLISH COURTS ON ENFORCEABILITY 114

THE ARGUMENT OF UNCERTAINTY RAISED IN <i>COURTNEY</i> ..	115
'BINDING' AND 'NON-BINDING' ADR FORMS AND 'FUTILITY' ARGUMENT <i>VIS-À-VIS</i> ENFORCEABILITY	117
REFRESHING ATTITUDE OF THE AUSTRALIAN COURTS	119
WAY FORWARD	120

Chapter 7

Without Prejudice Negotiations

NATURE	125
THE OPENING SHOT DOCUMENT	128
SUMMARY OF PRINCIPLES	129
THE POLICY BEHIND THE RULE	130
SETTING ASIDE THE VEIL OF 'WITHOUT PREJUDICE NEGOTIATIONS'	132
NO WITHOUT PREJUDICE AID TO INTERPRETATION	133
Conclusion	134

PART V

Cross-Cultural Mediation

Chapter 8

**Reconciling Differences: Cross-Cultural Mediation in
Malaysia**

INTRODUCTION	137
AN INSIGHT INTO CROSS-CULTURAL MEDIATION	139
Cross-Cultural Mediation: A Brief Introduction	139
When is Mediation necessary?	139
Mediation: A Culturally Neutral Process of Dispute Resolution	140
CROSS-CULTURAL ISSUES IN MEDIATION IN MALAYSIA	141
Cross-Cultural Mediation: Understanding the Cultural Dynamics	142
Cultural and Societal Stereotypes	143
Cross-Cultural Communication at the Negotiation Phase	144
How Cultural Differences can Impede Settlement ...	145

THE ROLES OF A MEDIATOR IN BRIDGING THE CULTURAL GAPS	147
Bridging the Cultural Gaps: A Proactive Mediator ...	148
Avoiding the Pitfalls in Cross-Cultural Mediation	148
Cross-Cultural Mediation Training in Malaysia	149
Conclusion	151

PART VI
Community Mediation

Chapter 9

Community Mediation

INTRODUCTION	155
Community Mediation	157
Types of neighbourhood disputes	158
Neighbourhood dispute: Who should mediate?.....	160
Benefits of community mediation	161
Community Mediation: The Islamic Approach	162
Community mediation in selected jurisdictions.....	166
Conclusion	169

PART VII
Mediation in Consumer Claims

Chapter 10

ADR for Consumers: An Appraisal of the Tribunal for Consumer Claims Malaysia

ABSTRACT	171
INTRODUCTION	172
Tribunal's Jurisdiction	173
Court's Proceedings	174
Prohibition of Legal Representation	175
Unclear Provisions on ADR Process.....	176
A Counter-claim Procedure.....	177
Appeal Procedure and Judicial Review.....	178
Non-compliance with the Award.....	180

Accessibility	181
Publicity	182
Conclusion.....	182

PART VIII

Mediation in Environmental and Land Disputes

Chapter 11

Alternative Dispute Resolution for Resolving Land Use and Environmental Disputes in Malaysia

INTRODUCTION	187
Evolution of Alternative Dispute Resolution in Malaysia.....	189
Types of Alternative Dispute Resolution Methods....	190
Overview of Evolution of Land Use and Environmental Dispute Resolution in Malaysia.....	193
Comparative Overview of Use of Alternative Dispute Resolution in Resolving Land Use and Environmental Disputes.....	196
Rationale for Proposing Alternative Dispute Resolution for Resolving Land Use and Environmental Disputes.....	200
Proposals for Malaysia	201
Way Forward – Directions for Incorporation of Alternative Dispute Resolution for Resolving Land Use and Environmental Disputes	206
Conclusion.....	210

PART IX

Mediation in Labour Disputes

Chapter 12

Conciliation and Mediation of Labour Disputes in Malaysia: With Reference to Unfair Dismissal Claims

INTRODUCTION	221
UNFAIR DISMISSAL CLAIM: THE LEVEL OF ITS SETTLEMENT.....	223
CONCILIATION MEETING AT INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS DEPARTMENT (IRD)	225

REFERRAL LEVEL: MINISTER DISCRETION TO REFER DISPUTE TO INDUSTRIAL COURT	233
ADJUDICATORY LEVEL: INDUSTRIAL COURT ADJUDICATES DISPUTES	234
MEDIATION IN THE INDUSTRIAL COURT	241
Conclusion	245

PART X
Mediation in Family Disputes

Chapter 13

**Mediation/Conciliation of Family Disputes Among
Non-Muslims in the Civil Court**

INTRODUCTION	249
Malaysian Mediation Centre.....	249
Mediation in the Legal Aid Bureau	250
Conciliation under the Law Reform (Marriage and Divorce) Act 1976.....	251
MANDATORY REFERENCE TO CONCILIATION/ RECONCILIATION UNDER SECTION 106.....	252
Appointment and Composition of the Conciliation Committee	254
Qualification of the Conciliatory Body	255
Duration of the Conciliation/Reconciliation Process	256
The Function and Role of the Conciliatory Bodies....	257
SOME ISSUES IN PRACTICE	258
Popularity of the Conciliation Institutions	258
Attendance of the parties.....	260
Conclusion	261

Chapter 14

**Reconciliation of Matrimonial Disputes: The Constrains
and Proposed Reform**

INTRODUCTION	267
DIVORCE ON THE RISE	268
RECONCILIATION: A PREREQUISITE FOR FILING A DIVORCE PETITION	270

CONSTRAINTS AND PROPOSED REFORM	274
Conclusion	278

PART XI
Mediation in Banking Disputes

Chapter 15

The Dilemma of Conflict of Jurisdiction in Islamic Banking and Finance: Mediation as a Solution – A Preliminary Observation

INTRODUCTION	281
Jurisdiction: Meaning and Term	282
The Constitutional Framework of Federal and State Jurisdictions under the Federal Constitution of Malaysia.....	283
The Constitutional Framework in Relation to Jurisdiction over Matters Pertaining to Islamic Banking.....	284
The Legal Framework of Islamic Banking in Malaysia	287
MEDIATION AND ISLAMIC BANKING IN MALAYSIA	292
Bank Negara Complaints Unit	292
The Financial Mediation Bureau (FMB) (Formerly known as the Banking Mediation Bureau).....	293
Some Aspects of Mediation in FMB	293
The Bar Council Malaysian Mediation Centre	295
Court Annexed Mediation	295
PRELIMINARY OBSERVATION AND SUGGESTION.....	296

PART XII
Mediation in Construction Industry

Chapter 16

Mediation in the Malaysian Construction Industry

INTRODUCTION	301
BACKGROUND OF THE CONSTRUCTION INDUSTRY IN MALAYSIA	302
Introduction.....	302
The Construction Industry Master Plan (CIMP)	303

Construction Disputes	304
Alternative Dispute Resolution	304
ADR in General.....	305
ADR in Malaysia	307
Features of Mediation	307
MEDIATION IN MALAYSIA	308
MEDIATION IN THE CONSTRUCTION INDUSTRY	309
CHALLENGES IN MEDIATION.....	311
CONSTRUCTION JUSTICE REFORMS ON MEDIATION.....	314
Conclusion.....	314

PART XIII

Mediation in Medical Negligence Claims

Chapter 17

Mediating Medical Negligence Claims in Malaysia: An Option for Reform

INTRODUCTION	321
THE TORT OR FAULT-BASED SYSTEM.....	322
PROBLEMS WITH THE TORT OR FAULT-BASED SYSTEM	322
Adversarial in nature.....	322
Unreliability of expert witnesses	322
The lengthy period in pursuing a claim	324
Effect of a medical negligence claim on the defendant doctor	324
Rise in medical insurance premium rates	325
Defensive medicine.....	325
ALTERNATIVES TO LITIGATION.....	326
Mediation	327
THE UNITED KINGDOM EXPERIENCE	328
THE AUSTRALIAN EXPERIENCE.....	330
IS MEDIATION AN OPTION FOR REFORM IN MALAYSIA?.....	331
Conclusion.....	333

PART XIV
Mediation in Criminal Cases

Chapter 18

Mediation in Criminal Cases

ABSTRACT	339
THE ATTORNEY GENERAL.....	340
PUBLIC PROSECUTOR ALTER-EGO	340
PRIMA FACIE CASE	341
PUBLIC PROSECUTOR TO ACT WITH FAIRNESS AND SAGACITY	343
DISCRETION TO DISCONTINUE PROSECUTION.....	347
EFFECTS OF WITHDRAWAL OF CHARGE.....	349
Conclusion.....	350

Chapter 19

Mediation in Islamic Criminal Law

INTRODUCTION	353
Crimes in Islamic Law and the Application of Mediation.....	354
Hadd	354
Qisas and diyah.....	356
Ta'zir	358
Pardon (<i>'Afw</i>) as a Type of Amicable Settlement of Punishment.....	359
Application of Mediation in Muslim countries.....	361
Conclusion.....	363

PART XV
Mediation in International Disputes

Chapter 20

**Mediation in International Disputes: A Useful Tool for
Peacemaking and Preventive Diplomacy**

INTRODUCTION	368
MEDIATION: A PEACEFUL MEANS OF SETTLING INTERNATIONAL DISPUTES.....	368
Mediation and Good Offices.....	369

Mediation as Enshrined in International Treaties.....	370
Who Are the Mediators?	371
MEDIATION THROUGH THE UNITED NATIONS	373
ATTRIBUTES OF A SUCCESSFUL MEDIATION	375
Conflict Ripeness (Timing)	375
Mediator Strength and Leverage	376
Effective Strategies for Implementation and Monitoring	377
MEDIATION IN INTERNATIONAL DISPUTES: SELECTED CASE-STUDIES	378
Iran Hostage Crisis and Algiers Accords: A Success Story of Mediation	378
Kosovo Crisis and Finnish Mediator Ahtisaari.....	379
Conclusion	381

PART XVI
Mediation in Syariah Law

Chapter 21

**Foundations of Mediation in Islamic Law and its
Contemporary Application**

ABSTRACT	385
INTRODUCTION	386
KEY WORDS: DEFINITION	386
Conciliation (<i>Sulh</i>)	386
Arbitration (<i>Tahkim</i>)	387
Mediation (<i>Wasaatah</i>)	387
Similarities and Differences	388
Proof of Legality of Mediation	388
Fundamentals of Mediation in Islamic Law.....	391
Contemporary Application of Mediation	393
Conclusion	394
REFERENCES	395

Chapter 22

Provisions on *Sulh* and its Application in the State of Selangor

INTRODUCTION 397

PROVISIONS ON *SULH* IN THE STATE OF SELANGOR..... 399

 The Islamic Family Law (State of Selangor) Enactment 2003 (IFLE 2003) 399

 The Syariah Court Civil Procedure Enactment 2003 (State of Selangor) (SCCPE 2003) 402

 The Syariah Civil Procedure (*Sulh*) Selangor Rules 2001 (SCCPSR 2001)..... 405

 Non-compliance and Retraction of Consent Order 410

QUALIFICATION OF *SULH* OFFICER 410

 Conclusion 411

Chapter 23

***Sulh* (Mediation) in the Malaysian Syariah Courts**

INTRODUCTION 415

Sulh in Islam 416

ADMINISTRATION OF SYARIAH COURT IN MALAYSIA..... 418

Sulh in Malaysia 419

Sulh Officers in Malaysia 421

 Ethical Code for *Sulh* Officers 423

 Conclusion 424

PART XVII

Mediation and Civil Procedure

Chapter 24

Court Annexed Mediation

INTRODUCTION 429

MEDIATION AND ITS PLACE IN MALAYSIAN CIVIL COURTS 430

DEFINITION OF COURT ANNEXED MEDIATION..... 433

STRUCTURE OF COURT MEDIATION 434

VIEWS ON THE PROCESS 435

ARGUMENTS IN FAVOUR OF COURT ANNEXED MEDIATION	436
ARGUMENTS AGAINST THE APPLICATION OF COURT ANNEXED MEDIATION	436
THE IMPORTANCE OF COURT ANNEXED MEDIATION	437
CASES THAT NEED TO GO FOR COURT ANNEXED MEDIATION	439
Family Cases.....	439
Running Down Cases.....	440
Banks' Loan Recovery	440
Construction cases.....	441
Medical Negligence	441
PROCEDURE	442
AN ANALYSIS ON THE RULES AND LAWS GOVERNING THE APPLICATION	444
Conclusion.....	446
Chapter 25	
Court Annexed Mediation with Reference to the Practice in Singapore	
MEDIATION IN THE CIVIL COURTS: THE SINGAPORE EXPERIENCE	453
Scope	456
Preliminary Matters.....	457
Parties and Witnesses	457
Conduct of the Settlement Conference.....	457
Conclusion.....	460
Chapter 26	
Consent Judgment or Order	
INTRODUCTION	463
CONSENT JUDGMENT OR ORDER: THE PRINCIPLES	466
CONSENT ORDER PERFECTED, COURT BECOMES <i>FUNCTUS OFFICIO</i>	470
VARYING CONSENT ORDER IN THE INTEREST OF JUSTICE	471
SETTING ASIDE OR NULLIFYING THE CONSENT ORDER	472

COMMITTAL PROCEEDINGS FOR BREACHES OF CONSENT ORDER	475
Conclusion	476

Chapter 27

Functus Officio

INTRODUCTION	479
<i>FUNCTUS OFFICIO</i>	480
CIRCUMSTANCES WHERE FINAL ORDER MAY BE SET ASIDE, AMENDED OR VARIED	485
INHERENT POWERS OF THE HIGH COURT	486
Conclusion	488

Chapter 28

Practice Direction on Mediation

PRACTICE DIRECTIONS	493
PRACTICE DIRECTION ON MEDIATION	496
Conclusion	501

PART XVIII

Mediators: Accreditation and Qualities

CHAPTER 29

Accreditation of Mediators in Malaysia

INTRODUCTION	505
MEDIATION: ACCREDITATION	509
Licensing	509
Accreditation or certification	510
Accreditation of mediators	510
ACCREDITATION OF MEDIATORS IN SELECTED JURISDICTIONS	515
Australia	515
United States	522
Canada	522
Singapore	523
United Kingdom	524

INTERNATIONAL MEDIATION INSTITUTE.....	525
ACCREDITATION OF MEDIATORS: WHETHER OPTIONAL OR OBLIGATORY	528
Conclusion.....	529
APPENDIX I	531
APPENDIX II	537
Chapter 30	
Qualities of a Mediator in Family Disputes: An Overview of Syariah and the Practice in Malaysia	
ABSTRACT.....	551
INTRODUCTION	552
BASIS IN THE QUR'AN ON QUALIFICATION OF ARBITRATORS	552
THE QUALIFICATIONS OF THE THIRD PARTY IN FAMILY DISPUTES	553
MUST THE ARBITRATORS/MEDIATORS BE FROM THE RELATIVES OF THE COUPLE?.....	555
THE PRACTICE IN THE SYARIAH COURT OF SELANGOR.....	556
Conclusion.....	557

PART XIX

Mediation: Challenges and Future Prospects

Chapter 31

**Should Compulsory Mediation be introduced
in Malaysia**

ABSTRACT.....	561
INTRODUCTION	562
What is mediation?	562
Mediation in Malaysia	563
Right of Access to Justice.....	564
Mandating Mediation in Family Disputes.....	566
Recommendations and suggestions	568
Conclusion.....	569

Chapter 32

Future Possibility of the Enactment of Mediation Law in Malaysia and the Text of a Proposed Mediation Law

NECESSARY BASIC INFORMATION FOR A LEGISLATIVE INITIATIVE 573

 Importance of Mediation 573

 Advantages of Mediation 574

 Even A Limited Application of Mediation in Malaysia Has Already Shown Its Worth 575

 Need to Retain the Existing Mediation Facilities 577

 Concurrent Need of Traditional and Modern Mediation in Malaysia 578

 Court-annexed Mediation 579

 A Case For Mandatory Mediation 581

 Matters Fit To Be Mediated 583

 Difference of Religion and Culture is Sometimes Relevant in Traditional Mediation 583

 Fairness, Power Balance and Ethics 583

 Confidentiality 584

BROAD STRUCTURE OF FUTURE LEGISLATIVE INITIATIVE IN MALAYSIA 585

 Preliminary Remarks 585

 The Existing Draft Mediation Act: A Critique 585

 Types of Mediation that the Proposed Act May Cover 586

Index 597