



Dismissal from Employment and the Remedies

Dr. Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed

 LexisNexis®

DISMISSAL FROM EMPLOYMENT AND THE REMEDIES

DR. ASHGAR ALI ALI MOHAMED

LL.B (Hons), MCL (IIUM),
LL.M (Hons) (University of Auckland, New Zealand),
Ph. D (Business Law),
Non-practising Advocate & Solicitor
of the High Court of Malaya



MEMBERS OF THE LEXISNEXIS GROUP WORLDWIDE

MALAYSIA	Malayan Law Journal Sdn Bhd,† Level 12A (Tower 2), Kelana Brem Tower, Jalan SS 7/15 (Jalan Stadium) 47301 Kelana Jaya, Selangor Darul Ehsan
ARGENTINA	LexisNexis Argentina, BUENOS AIRES
AUSTRALIA	LexisNexis Butterworths, Chatswood, NEW SOUTH WALES
AUSTRIA	LexisNexis Verlag ARD Orac GmbH & Co KG, VIENNA
CANADA	LexisNexis Butterworths, Markham, ONTARIO
CHILE	LexisNexis Chile Ltda, SANTIAGO DE CHILE
CZECH REPUBLIC	Nakladatelství Orac sro, PRAGUE
FRANCE	Editions du Juris-Classeur SA, PARIS
HONG KONG	LexisNexis, HONG KONG
HUNGARY	HVG-Orac, BUDAPEST
INDIA	LexisNexis, NEW DELHI
IRELAND	Butterworths (Ireland) Ltd, DUBLIN
ITALY	Giuffrè Editore, MILAN
NEW ZEALAND	Butterworths of New Zealand, WELLINGTON
PRC	LexisNexis Beijing Representative Office, BEIJING
POLAND	Wydawnictwo Prawnicze LexisNexis, WARSAW
SINGAPORE	LexisNexis, SINGAPORE
SOUTH AFRICA	Butterworths SA, DURBAN
SWITZERLAND	Stämpfli Verlag AG, BERNE
UNITED KINGDOM	LexisNexis Butterworths Tolley, LONDON AND EDINBURGH
USA	LexisNexis, Dayton, OHIO

© LexisNexis
A Division of Reed Elsevier (Singapore) Pte Ltd
2007

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, including photocopying and recording, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher. Such written permission must also be obtained before any part of this publication is stored in a retrieval system of any nature.

The Publisher, authors, contributors and endorsers of this publication each excludes liability for loss suffered by any person resulting in any way from the use of, or reliance on this publication.

†Company No. 76125-H
ISBN 978-967-962-795-4 (Practitioner Ed)
978-967-962-796-1 (Student Ed)

Printed in Malaysia by Vivar Printing Sdn Bhd

Table of Contents

Dedication.....	v
Foreword.....	vii
Acknowledgment.....	ix
Preface.....	xi
Table of Cases.....	xxv
Table of Statutes.....	lxv

Chapter 1

Security of Tenure in Employment and the Employer's Prerogative

Introduction.....	1
Loss of Employment: Its Effect on Workers.....	4
Employees in the Public Sector.....	8
Employees in the Private Sector.....	11
Employer's Prerogative to Make Commercial Decisions.....	16
Methodology Adopted.....	19
Objectives of the Study.....	22

Chapter 2

Security of Tenure in Employment: The Development

Introduction.....	25
Security of Tenure in Employment.....	26
'Property Right' in Employment.....	27
Evolution of Worker's Status and Security of Tenure.....	31
In England.....	31
Forced Labour.....	33
Combination of Workers: Promoting Workers' Status in Employment.....	36
Forced Labour Abolished.....	38
Change in the Terminology from 'Master' and 'Servant' to 'Employer' and 'Employee'.....	39
Doctrine of <i>Laissez-Faire</i> in Employment Relationship.....	40
Development of 'General Hiring' Theory.....	42
The 'At-Will' Employment Doctrine of the United States.....	44

Discharge on Good Faith Doctrine	49
Discharge in Violation of Public Policy	49
Status of Workers during British Administrative Authority in the Malay Peninsular	51
Migration of Foreign Labourers into the Malay Peninsular	51
Workers' Status during British Administration of the Malay Peninsular	53
International Labour Organisation (ILO): Promoting and Protecting Worker's Status and Security of Tenure in Employment	57
An Overview of the International Labour Organisation	57
ILO Recommendation No. 119 of 1963	59
ILO Convention No. 158 of 1982	61
ILO Recommendation No. 166 of 1982	65
The Application of the ILO's Guidelines in Malaysia	70
Conclusion	72

Chapter 3

Common Law Wrongful Dismissal and Statutory Unfair Dismissal

Introduction.....	73
Security of Tenure: Common Law Approach.....	74
Notice of Termination of the Contract of Employment: Binding Effect	75
Reasonable Notice of Termination	77
Termination of Contract of Employment: Reasonable Notice in England.....	81
Termination of Contract of Employment: Reasonable Notice in Canada	82
Termination of Contract of Employment: Reasonable Notice in Australia	84
Termination of Contract of Employment: Reasonable Notice in New Zealand.....	84
Termination of Contract of Employment: Reasonable Notice in Malaysia.....	85
Waiver of Notice of Termination: The Circumstances	86
Specific Performance of a Contract of Employment.....	87
Mitigation of Loss	92
Statutory Unfair or Unjustifiable Dismissal	94
Substantive Justification	95

Procedural Justification.....	96
Application in Selected Countries	96
Remedies for Unfair or Unjustifiable Dismissal	100
Reinstatement or Re-engagement.....	100
Monetary Compensation	101
Mitigation of Loss	103
Redundancy Compensation.....	104
Wrongful Dismissal and Unfair or Unjustifiable Dismissal: The Comparison.....	106
Conclusion	111

Chapter 4

Types of Dismissal and the Grounds

Introduction.....	113
Direct Dismissal.....	115
Constructive Dismissal	116
Constructive Dismissal: Definition	117
Constructive Dismissal: The Development.....	121
Employment Relationship: Mutual Trust and Confidence	122
Conduct Infringing the Implied Trust and Confidence	127
Burden of Proof in Constructive Dismissal	131
Grounds of Dismissal.....	133
Misconduct	134
Disobedience of Lawful and Reasonable Orders.....	137
Absenteeism	142
Drug Abuse in the Workplace.....	147
Theft of Employer's Property.....	151
Sexual Harassment.....	154
Poor Work Performance	171
Non-Renewal of Fixed Term Contract of Employment.....	175

Chapter 5

Retrenchment of Surplus Labour: When It Constitute a Dismissal?

Introduction.....	181
The Law on Retrenchment in Malaysia	182
Terminologies	183
Lay-off	183
Retrenchment.....	184
Redundancy	185

Redundancy to Retrenchment: The Circumstances	186
The Business Disappears – The Company is Shutting down the Business Entirely	188
The Place of Work Disappears – The Employer is Shutting down the Business in the Place where the Employee Works.....	189
Where the Mobility Clause is Expressly Clear and Unambiguous	190
Harshness of the Mobility Clause.....	190
Implied Terms of Transfer	191
The Job Disappears – The Company Eliminates the Work the Employee Does, either Generally or in a Particular Workplace	192
Fewer People are Required to Do the Work – The Number of People Doing that Job is to be Reduced but Not Eliminated	193
Retrenchment Benefits.....	195
Qualification for Retrenchment Benefits in Malaysia.....	196
Amount of Termination and Lay-off Benefits and Mode of Calculation	199
Availability of Retrenchment Benefits for Workers	
Outside the Purview of the Employment Act 1955	199
Individual Contract of Employment.....	200
Collective Agreement	200
Implied Term for the Payment of Retrenchment Benefit.....	201
Invoking the Code for the Payment of Retrenchment Benefit.....	203
Acceptance of the Retrenchment Benefits and thereafter Alleging Dismissal without Just Cause or Excuse	203
Dismissal in the Guise of Retrenchment	205
Did a Redundancy Situation Arise Leading to a Retrenchment?	206
If There was a Redundancy Situation, was the Consequent Retrenchment Made in Compliance or in Conformity with the Accepted Standards of Procedure?	206
Proof and the Test of Redundancy	208
Conclusion	210

Chapter 6**Dismissal without Just Cause or Excuse: The Adjudication Process**

Introduction.....	213
Dismissal from Employment:	
The Preliminary Consideration	214
The Limitation Period to Make Representation	215
The Claimant in His Representation must Pray for Reinstatement	219
Death and Survival of Action.....	222
The Common Law Approach.....	224
The Statutory Unfair Dismissal Approach.....	225
A Review of <i>Hotel Istana v Nor Azam Baharin</i>	230
Process of Adjudication of Dismissal Cases under Section 20 of the IRA.....	239
The Conciliation Process in IRD.....	242
Discretion of the Minister to Refer Dismissal Cases to the Industrial Court.....	246
Industrial Court: The Adjudication Process.....	251
Industrial Court: An Overview.....	251
The Composition of the Industrial Court.....	255
Types of Cases Heard in the Industrial Court	257
Industrial Court: A Court of Equity and Good Conscience Promoting Social Justice.....	259
Industrial Court: The Process.....	264
Legalism in the Industrial Court	266
Conclusion	272

Chapter 7**Reinstatement in Dismissal without Just Cause or Excuse: By Analysis and Case Study**

Introduction.....	275
Reinstatement: The Primary Remedy for Dismissal without Just Cause or Excuse	277
Reinstatement: Definition.....	278
Reinstatement includes Re-engagement	279
The Remedy of Reinstatement: Within the Discretion of the Industrial Court.....	280
The Wishes of the Claimant.....	281
Whether the Award of Reinstatement is Expedient	283

The Existence or otherwise of Mutual Trust and Confidence	284
Harmonious Relationship at the Workplace cannot be Restored	287
Examples of the Circumstances where Reinstatement Awarded	288
An Award of Reinstatement: The Events Subsequent to its Compliance	291
Reinstatement Becoming a Lost Remedy	292
Reinstatement in Dismissal Cases: A Case Study	294
Nature of the Claimant's Employment	295
Permanent Employment	295
Employees on Probationary Period	298
Employees on a Fixed Term Contract	299
Part-Time Worker	301
Casual Workers	302
Employees under Work Sharing	302
Home Workers	304
Voluntary Workers	305
Foreign Workers	306
The Grounds of the Dismissal and the Remedy of Reinstatement	308
Dismissal on Alleged Poor Work Performance	308
Misconduct	310
Constructive Dismissal	311
Redundancy Situation	312
Non-Appearance of the Employer during Trial: The Preferred Remedy for Dismissal without Just Cause or Excuse	313
Delay of Adjudication: Its Effect on Reinstatement	314
Interim Reinstatement	318
Interim Reinstatement: The Practice in England	319
Interim Reinstatement: The Practice in New Zealand	319
Conclusion	325

Chapter 8

Monetary Compensation for Dismissal without Just Cause or Excuse

Introduction	327
The Types of Monetary Compensation	331
Compensation <i>in lieu</i> of Reinstatement	332

Back Wages	333
The Assessment of Monetary Compensation: Its Drawbacks	334
Assessment of Compensation <i>in lieu</i> of Reinstatement	334
The Inconsistency in the Award of Back Wages	340
Loss of Future Earning.....	354
Scaling Down of Monetary Compensation	355
Where the Claimant has been Gainfully Employed Elsewhere during the Interim Period	356
When the Claimant had in any way Caused or Contributed to His Own Predicament.....	360
Global Assessment of the Monetary Award.....	363
Legislative Guidelines in the Assessment of Monetary Compensation: Proposed Reform.....	371
Maximum and Minimum Cap of Compensation.....	372
Interest on the Monetary Award	373
Cost of the Proceedings	374
Proposed Clauses on Remedies for Dismissal to be Entrenched into the IRA.....	374
Remedies.....	374
Reinstatement to be Primary Remedy.....	375
Provisions Applying if Reinstatement Ordered	375
The Industrial Court may Order Interim Reinstatement....	375
Reimbursement	376
Compensation.....	376
Remedy Reduced if Contributing Behaviour of Workman	377
Mitigation of Loss	377
The Limitation of Monetary Compensation	377
Power to Award Costs.....	378
Interest on the Monetary Award of the Industrial Court.....	378
Conclusion	378

Chapter 9

Judicial Review of the Industrial Court Award

Introduction.....	379
Contesting Award of the Industrial Court	380
Judicial Review is Concerning the Decision Making Process	383

Development of Judicial Review since <i>South East Asia Firebrick's</i>	385
Judicial Review of the Awards of the Industrial Court: Its Blemish.....	391
Judicial Review of the Award.....	392
Not Keeping <i>in tandem</i> with the Spirit of the IRA.....	392
An Unequal Legal Battle.....	396
The Infusion of Common Law Principles into Industrial Jurisprudence.....	397
The Mechanism of the Industrial Appeal Court.....	405

Chapter 10

Enforcement of the Industrial Court Award

Introduction.....	409
Stay of Execution of the Industrial Court's Award.....	410
Enforcement of the Award: The Process and the Mode.....	414
Whether Advocates Precluded at the Hearing under Section 56.....	420
Execution of the Award.....	422

Chapter 11

Insolvent Corporate Employer: Whether Worker's Claims Arising Out of Employment Adequately Protected?

Introduction.....	425
Inadequate Protection of Workers' Statutory Entitlements.....	426
Winding-up Order of the Corporate Employer and Its Effect on Contract of Service.....	428
Distribution of the Assets of the Insolvent Employer and the Preferential Payment.....	431
ILO's Convention and Recommendation.....	431
Distribution of the Insolvent Employer's Assets.....	434
'Wage Earner Corporate Insolvency Fund'.....	438
Conclusion.....	440

Chapter 12

Employment Obligations: The Islamic Perspective

General.....	441
Seeking Employment: The Islamic Approach.....	442
The Employer/Employee Relationship.....	445
Employee's Obligation to Discharge ' <i>Amanah</i> ' or Trust.....	447

Discharging Duties Conscientiously : The Employees' Responsibilities	450
Failure to Discharge Responsibilities Conscientiously	452
Protection of Human Dignity	456
Sexual Harassment: The Islamic Approach	459
Drug Abuse in the Workplace and Rights of the Employer	461
Transforming the Islamic Injunction into Law	462
Accountability in the hereafter	464
Appendix	467
Bibliography	521
Index	549