FOREIGN WORKERS

The Law And Practice In Malaysia

Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed
Farheen Baig Sardar Baig
Muzaffar Syah Mallow
Mohammad Naqib Ishan Jan

CLJ Publication
## CONTENTS

Preface i  
Acknowledgement iii  
Foreword v  
Biographies of Contributors vii  
List of Abbreviations ix  
Table of Cases xi  
Table of Legislation xix  
Table of Foreign Legislation xxxvii

### CHAPTER 1

**MIGRANT WORKERS: AN INTRODUCTION**  
by Farheen Baig Sardar Baig

1.1 INTRODUCTION 1  
1.2 MIGRANT WORKER AND WORK PERMIT 9  
1.3 EMPLOYMENT OF MIGRANT WORKERS IN A FOREIGN LAND: THE REASONS 11  
1.4 EXPLOITATION OF MIGRANT WORKERS 15  
1.5 CHAPTERIZATION 21  
1.6 CONCLUSION 24

### CHAPTER 2

**CONTRACT OF EMPLOYMENT: A NON-COMMERCIAL CONTRACT**  
by Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed

2.1 INTRODUCTION 25  
2.2 CONTRACT LAW IN RELATION TO EMPLOYMENT 28  
2.3 FREEDOM OF CONTRACT: A REALITY IN CONTRACT OF EMPLOYMENT? 29  
2.4 CONTRACT OF EMPLOYMENT: A COMMERCIAL OR PERSONAL CONTRACT 33  
2.4.1 Employer-Employee Relationship: A Special or Personal Relationship 33  
2.4.2 Relationship between Employer and Employee - Regulated by 'Status' not 'Contract' 36  
2.4.2.1 The Introduction of Statutory Protection and Erosion of Freedom to Contract 38  
2.4.2.2 Against Exploitation of Workers in Employment: Implying Terms 40  
2.4.3 Implying Terms in the Contract of Employment 41  
2.4.3.1 The Recognition of the Implied term of Trust and Confidence 44  
2.4.3.2 The Origin of the Implied Trust and Confidence Term 46  
2.4.3.3 The Employer's Conduct of Infringing the Implied Term of Confidence and Trust 49  
2.4.4 International Labour Organisation Slogan: 'Labour is not a Commodity' and the Performance of Service is not Akin to the Supply of Goods 53  
2.5 CONCLUSION 55
## Contents

### CHAPTER 3
MIGRATION OF FOREIGN LABOURERS INTO MALAYSIA

*by Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>FOREIGN INVASION INTO THE MALAY PENINSULA</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>MIGRATION OF FOREIGN LABOURERS</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>CONDITIONS OF MIGRANT WORKERS</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>LABOUR LEGISLATION PROTECTING MIGRANT WORKERS</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>INFLUENCE OF THE DOCTRINE OF LAISSEZ-FAIRE</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>INFUX OF MIGRANT WORKERS Since 1957</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>CONCLUSION</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CHAPTER 4
INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS ON TREATMENT OF MIGRANT WORKERS

*by Farheen Baig Sardar Baig*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>INTERNATIONAL LABOUR ORGANISATION (ILO)</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>ILO MULTILATERAL FRAMEWORK ON LABOUR MIGRATION (MFLM) - NON-BINDING PRINCIPLES AND GUIDELINES FOR A RIGHTS-BASED APPROACH TO LABOUR MIGRATION</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1</td>
<td>MFLM - Principles and Basic Guidelines</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2</td>
<td>Review of ILO's MFLM</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>ILO RELATED INSTRUMENTS ON MIGRANT WORKERS</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 4.5
UNITED NATIONS INSTRUMENT: INTERNATIONAL CONVENTION ON THE PROTECTION OF ALL MIGRANT WORKERS AND MEMBERS OF THEIR FAMILIES | 97  |

### 4.6

### CHAPTER 5
RIGHTS OF WORKERS FROM THE ISLAMIC PERSPECTIVE

*by Farheen Baig Sardar Baig*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>HISTORY OF FOREIGN WORKERS IN ISLAM</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>TREATMENT TOWARDS SLAVES / FOREIGN WORKERS</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.1</td>
<td>Equality</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.2</td>
<td>Kindness, Maintenance as a Moral Duty</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.3</td>
<td>Masters/Employers Should Not Have Harsh Attitude towards Servants/Workers</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.4</td>
<td>Humility and Respect towards Slaves and Establishing Brotherhood between Master and Slave</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.5</td>
<td>Human Dignity</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>CONCLUSION</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 8
EXPLOITATION OF MIGRANT WORKERS: ITS FORMS
by Mohammad Naqib Ishan Jan
8.1 INTRODUCTION 197
8.2 DEFINITION OF MIGRANT WORKERS 198
8.3 PULL AND THE PUSH FACTORS DRIVING MIGRATION 200
8.4 EXPLOITATION OF MIGRANT WORKERS 200
8.4.1 Forms of Exploitation of Migrant Workers 201
8.5 STATES’ OBLIGATION TO PROTECT THE HUMAN RIGHTS OF MIGRANT WORKERS 209
8.6 CONCLUSION 218

CHAPTER 9
EXPLOITATION OF MIGRANT WORKERS: THE LIKELY IDENTIFIABLE CAUSES
by Muzaffar Syah Mallorw
9.1 INTRODUCTION 219
9.2 THE ABUSE AND EXPLOITATION OF MIGRANT WORKERS IN MALAYSIA 220
9.2.1 Inefficient and Inadequate Legal Protection towards Migrant Workers 222
9.2.2 Social Misunderstanding toward Migrant Workers 226
9.2.3 Lack of Religious or Moral Values of the Abuser or Exploiter 226
9.3 CONCLUSION 230

CHAPTER 10
EXPLOITATION OF MIGRANT WORKERS: A CASE STUDY
by Muzaffar Syah Mallorw
10.1 INTRODUCTION 231
10.2 AN OVERVIEW OF REPORTED CASES INVOLVING THE EXPLOITATION OF MIGRANT WORKERS IN MALAYSIA 232
10.3 ABUSE CASES INVOLVING MIGRANT WORKERS IN MALAYSIA: THE LEGAL IMPACT 240
10.4 CONCLUSION 241
CHAPTER 11A
EXPLOITATION OF MIGRANT WORKERS: CRIMINAL SANCTIONS PROVIDED UNDER THE MALAYSIAN PENAL CODE
by Musaffar Sadiq Mallia

11A.1 INTRODUCTION 243

11A.2 AN OVERVIEW OF THE THEORY AND PRINCIPLES OF CRIMINAL LAW 244

11A.3 THE STANDARD COMMON LAW TEST OF CRIMINAL LIABILITY: ACTUS NON FACIT REUM NISI MENS SIT REA 249

11A.3.1 Actus reus 250

11A.3.1.1 Act 251

11A.3.1.2 Omission 252

11A.3.2 Mens rea 256

11A.4 EXPLOITATION OF MIGRANT WORKERS: CRIMINAL SANCTIONS PROVIDED UNDER THE MALAYSIAN PENAL CODE 260

11A.4.1 Possible Sanctions under the Malaysian Penal Code (Act 574) 260

11A.4.2 Case Study Involving Migrant Workers which Had Been Tried by the Courts under the Penal Code 267

11A.4.3 Criminal Sentencing Principle in Malaysia 279

11A.6 CONCLUSION 280

CHAPTER 11B
CRIMINAL OFFENCES AND CIVIL WRONGS BY OR AGAINST MIGRANT WORKERS
by Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed

11B.1 PHYSICAL ABUSE OR ILL-TREATMENT OF MIGRANT WORKERS: THE PUNISHMENT 281

11B.2 OFFENCES AGAINST MIGRANT WORKERS: ILLUSTRATION FROM DECIDED CASES 284

11B.3 A REVIEW OF SELECTED CASES 289

11B.4 CONCLUSION 306

CHAPTER 12
EXPLOITATION OF NATIONAL OR LOCAL WORKERS AND THE LIABILITY OF THE EMPLOYER
by Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed

12.1 INTRODUCTION 307

12.2 LABOUR IS NOT A COMMODITY 310

12.3 FORCED LABOUR PROHIBITED 311

12.4 RELATIONSHIP OF MUTUAL TRUST AND CONFIDENCE 315

12.5 EMPLOYEES' RIGHTS IN EMPLOYMENT AKIN TO 'PROPERTY RIGHTS' 317

12.5.1 Withholding of Salary or Failure of Salary Payment 318

12.5.2 Demotion or Reduction in Status and Rank 320

12.5.3 Transfer of Employee 322

12.5.4 Secondment Must Be Bona Fide 326
12.5.5 Retrenchment Justifiable on Genuine Commercial Reasons 329
12.5.6 Outsourcing to Victimise Employee 331
12.5.7 Voluntary Separation Scheme Being Forced or Coerced on Employee 332
12.5.8 Other Circumstances 334
12.6 CONSTRUCTIVE DISMISSAL AND REMEDIES 335
12.6.1 Constructive Dismissal 335
12.6.2 Remedies for Dismissal without Just Cause or Excuse 340
12.7 CONCLUSION 342

CHAPTER 13
PREMATURE TERMINATION OF FIXED-TERM CONTRACT AND ITS REMEDIES
by Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed
13.1 INTRODUCTION 343
13.2 FIXED-TERM ENGAGEMENT ON GENUINE GROUNDS 347
13.3 LEGITIMATE EXPECTATION OF RENEWAL OF FIXED-TERM ENGAGEMENT 350
13.4 COMPENSATION FOR PREMATURE TERMINATION OF FIXED-TERM CONTRACT 356
13.5 HIRING MIGRANT WORKERS OR EXPATRIATES ON FIXED-TERM CONTRACT 358
13.6 CASES ON NON-RENEWAL OF FIXED-TERM CONTRACTS INVOLVING MIGRANT WORKERS 360
13.7 CONCLUSION 368

CHAPTER 14
MIGRANT WORKERS: ADEQUACY AND SUFFICIENCY OF LAW
by Farheen Baig Sardar Baig
14.1 INTRODUCTION 369
14.2 MIGRANT WORKERS’ ACCESS TO JUSTICE 370
14.3 ADEQUACY AND SUFFICIENCY OF THE LAW 374
14.4 PROBLEMS FACED BY MIGRANT WORKERS 378
14.4.1 Discriminatory Wages 378
14.4.2 Inadequate Housing 379
14.4.3 Insurance 379
14.4.4 Medical Facilities 379
14.4.5 Cancellation of Work Permits 380
14.4.6 High Costs for Renewing Work Passes 380
14.4.7 Other Related Problems 381
14.5 RECOMMENDATIONS 382
14.6 ESTABLISHING MIGRANT WORKERS’ RIGHTS: ITS IMPORTANCE 385
14.7 CONCLUSION 388
CHAPTER 15
ASYLUM SEEKERS AND THE RIGHT TO WORK
by Muhammad Najib Ishan Jan
15.1 INTRODUCTION 389
15.2 THE DEFINITIONS OF ASYLUM AND ASYLUM SEEKERS 391
15.2.1 Definition of Asylum 391
15.2.2 Definition of Asylum Seeker 393
15.3 PROTECTION TO ASYLUM SEEKERS EASIER SAID THAN DONE 394
15.4 CLASSIFICATION OF ASYLUM 395
15.4.1 Territorial Asylum 396
15.4.2 Extra-Territorial or Diplomatic Asylum 399
15.5 THE RIGHT TO WORK: IS IT AVAILABLE UNDER INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW TO ASYLUM SEEKERS 404
15.6 THE RIGHT TO WORK: IS IT AVAILABLE TO ASYLUM SEEKERS IN MALAYSIA? 412
15.7 CONCLUSION 414

CHAPTER 16
HUMAN TRAFFICKING AND SMUGGLING OF MIGRANTS: THE INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS AND DOMESTIC LAWS OF MALAYSIA
by Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed
16.1 INTRODUCTION 415
16.2 HUMAN TRAFFICKING: THE INSTRUMENTS 416
16.2.1 United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime 416
16.2.2 Malaysian Anti-Trafficking in Persons and Anti-Smuggling of Migrants Act 2007 (Act 670) 430
16.3 DECIDED CASES OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING: A REVIEW 454
16.4 ISLAMIC APPROACH TO HUMAN TRAFFICKING 475
16.5 CONCLUSION 477

CHAPTER 17
DILIGENCE AND TRUSTWORTHINESS: THE QUALITIES OF A MUSLIM EMPLOYEE
by Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed
17.1 INTRODUCTION 489
17.2 EMPLOY HIM WHO IS STRONG AND TRUSTWORTHY 493
17.3 CONCLUSION 504

CHAPTER 18
IMMIGRATION LAW, RULES AND PROCEDURE FOR MIGRANT WORKERS: A COMPARATIVE STUDY FROM VARIOUS JURISDICTIONS
by Musaffar Syaz Mallow
18.1 INTRODUCTION 507
18.2 IMMIGRATION LAW, RULES AND PROCEDURE FOR MIGRANT WORKERS UNDER VARIOUS JURISDICTIONS 510
18.2.1 United States of America 511
18.2.2 United Kingdom 516
18.2.3 Australia 519
18.2.4 Hong Kong 520
18.2.5 Singapore 525
18.2.6 Saudi Arabia 527
## Chapter 19

**The Law on Minimum Wages in Malaysia**

by Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>19.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>533</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.2</td>
<td>Minimum wage fixing convention, 1970 (No. 131)</td>
<td>534</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.3</td>
<td>Minimum wage fixing recommendation, 1970 (No. 135)</td>
<td>536</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.4</td>
<td>Minimum rate of wages from Islamic perspective</td>
<td>539</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.5</td>
<td>Minimum wage law in selected countries</td>
<td>541</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.6</td>
<td>Minimum wages order 2012 (Malaysia)</td>
<td>545</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.7</td>
<td>Application of minimum wages order: an employee under a contract of service</td>
<td>546</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.7.1</td>
<td>The rates of minimum wages</td>
<td>549</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.7.2</td>
<td>Council to review minimum wages order</td>
<td>553</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.7.3</td>
<td>Negotiation for restructuring of wages</td>
<td>553</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.7.4</td>
<td>Enforcement of the minimum wages order</td>
<td>554</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.7.5</td>
<td>Compounding of offences</td>
<td>555</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.7.6</td>
<td>Protection of informers or whistleblowers</td>
<td>556</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.7.7</td>
<td>Implementation of minimum wages order: the guidelines</td>
<td>557</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Appendices

- Appendix A
- Appendix B
- Appendix BA
- Appendix C
- Appendix CA
- Appendix D
- Appendix E
- Appendix F

## Index

697
HUMAN TRAFFICKING AND SMUGGLING OF MIGRANTS: THE INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS AND DOMESTIC LAWS OF MALAYSIA

16.1 INTRODUCTION

Human trafficking and smuggling of migrants is a global problem. It is a major crime against humanity and a sheer violation of the basic human rights. It involves illegal trade of human beings for commercial purposes such as sexual exploitation, prostitution, slavery, servitude, forced labour or illegal organ removal. People are being bought, sold and are transported, transferred, harboured or received through use of force, coercion or other means for the purpose of exploitation and this problem is faced by most of the third world countries. Further, victims of smuggling are often promised attractive jobs in the destined country. However, on arrival, they find themselves exploited or coerced into forced labour. They are forced to live in sub-human conditions, passports confiscated and are made to work for extremely long hours with menial wages, amongst others.

In order to prevent and combat human trafficking and smuggling of migrants, the United Nations General Assembly had, in 2000, adopted inter alia the 'Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children' and the 'Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air.' These Protocols were enacted pursuant to the United Nations' Convention against Transnational Organised Crime which came into force on 29 September 2003 and are enforced by the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC).

---

* This Chapter is contributed by Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed.

1 In Bahurudeen Mohamed Yusoff Ghane v. Public Prosecutor [2011] MLJU 46, Mohd Amin Firdaus Abdullah, JC observed: 'most of the Third World countries, their mass media report that countries all over the world count drugs trafficking, firearms trafficking, and human trafficking, as common major offences faced by them.'