FOREIGN WORKERS
The Law And Practice In Malaysia

Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed
Farheen Baig Sardar Baig
Muzaffar Syah Mallow
Mohammad Naqib Ishan Jan

CLJ Publication
# CONTENTS

Preface
Acknowledgement
Foreword
Biographies of Contributors
List of Abbreviations
Table of Cases
Table of Legislation
Table of Foreign Legislation

## CHAPTER 1
MIGRANT WORKERS: AN INTRODUCTION
by Farheen Baig Sardar Baig

1.1 INTRODUCTION 1
1.2 MIGRANT WORKER AND WORK PERMIT 9
1.3 EMPLOYMENT OF MIGRANT WORKERS IN A FOREIGN LAND: THE REASONS 11
1.4 EXPLOITATION OF MIGRANT WORKERS 15
1.5 CHAPTERIZATION 21
1.6 CONCLUSION 24

## CHAPTER 2
CONTRACT OF EMPLOYMENT: A NON-COMMERCIAL CONTRACT
by Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed

2.1 INTRODUCTION 25
2.2 CONTRACT LAW IN RELATION TO EMPLOYMENT 28
2.3 FREEDOM OF CONTRACT: A REALITY IN CONTRACT OF EMPLOYMENT? 29
2.4 CONTRACT OF EMPLOYMENT: A COMMERCIAL OR PERSONAL CONTRACT 33
2.4.1 Employer-Employee Relationship: A Special or Personal Relationship 33
2.4.2 Relationship between Employer and Employee - Regulated by ‘Status’ not ‘Contract’ 36
2.4.2.1 The Introduction of Statutory Protection and Erosion of Freedom to Contract 38
2.4.2.2 Against Exploitation of Workers in Employment: Implying Terms 40
2.4.3 Implying Terms in the Contract of Employment 41
2.4.3.1 The Recognition of the Implied term of Trust and Confidence 44
2.4.3.2 The Origin of the Implied Trust and Confidence Term 46
2.4.3.3 The Employer’s Conduct of Infringing the Implied Term of Confidence and Trust 49
2.4.4 International Labour Organisation Slogan: ‘Labour is not a Commodity’ and the Performance of Service is not Akin to the Supply of Goods 53
2.5 CONCLUSION 55
CHAPTER 3
MIGRATION OF FOREIGN LABOURERS INTO MALAYSIA
by Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed

3.1 INTRODUCTION 57
3.2 FOREIGN INVASION INTO THE MALAY PENINSULA 61
3.3 MIGRATION OF FOREIGN LABOURERS 62
3.4 CONDITIONS OF MIGRANT WORKERS 63
3.5 LABOUR LEGISLATION PROTECTING MIGRANT WORKERS 66
3.7 INFLUENCE OF THE DOCTRINE OF L A I S S E Z - F A I R E 69
3.7 INFUX OF MIGRANT WORKERS SINCE 1957 70
3.8 CONCLUSION 71

CHAPTER 4
INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS ON TREATMENT OF MIGRANT WORKERS
by Farheen Baig Sardar Baig

4.1 INTRODUCTION 73
4.2 INTERNATIONAL LABOUR ORGANISATION (ILO) 74
4.3 ILO MULTILATERAL FRAMEWORK ON LABOUR MIGRATION (MFLM) - NON-BINDING PRINCIPLES AND GUIDELINES FOR A RIGHTS-BASED APPROACH TO LABOUR MIGRATION 76
4.3.1 MFLM - Principles and Basic Guidelines 77
4.3.2 Review of ILO's MFLM 92
4.4 ILO RELATED INSTRUMENTS ON MIGRANT WORKERS 93
4.5 UNITED NATIONS INSTRUMENT: INTERNATIONAL CONVENTION ON THE PROTECTION OF ALL MIGRANT WORKERS AND MEMBERS OF THEIR FAMILIES 97

CHAPTER 5
RIGHTS OF WORKERS FROM THE ISLAMIC PERSPECTIVE
by Farheen Baig Sardar Baig

5.1 INTRODUCTION 103
5.2 HISTORY OF FOREIGN WORKERS IN ISLAM 103
5.3 TREATMENT TOWARDS SLAVES / FOREIGN WORKERS 105
5.3.1 Equality 106
5.3.2 Kindness, Maintenance as a Moral Duty 106
5.3.3 Masters/Employers Should Not Have Harsh Attitude towards Servants/Workers 108
5.3.4 Humility and Respect towards Slaves and Establishing Brotherhood between Master and Slave 110
5.3.5 Human Dignity 113
5.4 CONCLUSION 116
CHAPTER 6
EMPLOYMENT STATUTES
AND THEIR APPLICATION
TOWARDS MIGRANT WORKERS
by Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed

6.1 INTRODUCTION 117
6.2 EMPLOYMENT ACT 1955 118
6.3 EMPLOYMENT
(TERMINATION AND
LAY-OFF BENEFITS)
REGULATIONS 1980 120
6.4 EMPLOYEES PROVIDENT
FUND ACT 1991 121
6.5 EMPLOYEES' SOCIAL
SECURITY ACT 1969 123
6.6 WORKMEN'S
COMPENSATION
ACT 1952 126
6.7 WORKMEN'S
COMPENSATION (FOREIGN
WORKER'S COMPENSATION
SCHEME) (INSURANCE)
ORDER 2005 127
6.8 INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS
ACT 1967 127
6.9 TRADE UNIONS ACT 1959 130
6.10 OCCUPATIONAL SAFETY
AND HEALTH ACT 1994 130
6.11 FACTORIES AND
MACHINERY ACT 1967 131
6.12 WORKERS' MINIMUM
STANDARDS OF HOUSING
AND AMENITIES ACT
1990 132
6.13 SECTION 28A OF THE
CIVIL LAW ACT 1956 132
6.14 CONTRACT LAW 137
6.15 PROTECTION AT
COMMON LAW 140
6.15.1 Implied Term of Trust
and Confidence 140
6.15.2 Employer's Duty of Care
for the Health and
Safety of Employee 144
6.16 JURISDICTION OF THE
INDUSTRIAL COURT
AND THE LABOUR
COURT 145
6.16.1 Industrial Court 145
6.16.2 Labour Court 146
6.17 CONCLUSION 147

CHAPTER 7A
MIGRANT WORKERS: THE
IMMIGRATION LAW, RULES AND
PROCEDURES IN MALAYSIA
by Muzaffar Suhak Mallow

7A.1 INTRODUCTION 149
7A.2 THE GOVERNING BODY
WHICH ENFORCES THE
IMMIGRATION LAWS IN
MALAYSIA 149
7A.3 IMMIGRATION ACT
1959/1963 (REVISED 1974) 152
7A.3.1 Admission and Departure 153
7A.3.2 Entry Permit 166
7A.3.3 Removal of Prohibited
Immigrants from Malaysia 174
7A.4 CONCLUSION 175

CHAPTER 7B
HIRING MIGRANT WORKERS:
RESTRICTION WITH
REFERENCE TO EMPLOYMENT
(RESTRICTION) ACT 1968
by Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed

7B.1 RESTRICTIONS UNDER
THE EMPLOYMENT
(RESTRICTION) ACT 1968 177
7B.2 RESTRICTION UNDER
THE EMPLOYMENT
(RESTRICTION)
(EMPLOYMENT PERMIT)
REGULATIONS 1969 184
CHAPTER 8
EXPLOITATION OF MIGRANT WORKERS: ITS FORMS
by Mohamad Naqib Ishan Jan
8.1 INTRODUCTION 197
8.2 DEFINITION OF MIGRANT WORKERS 198
8.3 PULL AND THE PUSH FACTORS DRIVING MIGRATION 200
8.4 EXPLOITATION OF MIGRANT WORKERS 200
8.4.1 Forms of Exploitation of Migrant Workers 201
8.5 STATES’ OBLIGATION TO PROTECT THE HUMAN RIGHTS OF MIGRANT WORKERS 209
8.6 CONCLUSION 218

CHAPTER 9
EXPLOITATION OF MIGRANT WORKERS: THE LIKELY IDENTIFIABLE CAUSES
by Mazaffar Syah Mallow
9.1 INTRODUCTION 219
9.2 THE ABUSE AND EXPLOITATION OF MIGRANT WORKERS IN MALAYSIA 220
9.2.1 Inefficient and Inadequate Legal Protection towards Migrant Workers 222
9.2.2 Social Misunderstanding toward Migrant Workers 226
9.2.3 Lack of Religious or Moral Values of the Abuser or Exploiter 226
9.3 CONCLUSION 230

CHAPTER 10
EXPLOITATION OF MIGRANT WORKERS: A CASE STUDY
by Mazaffar Syah Mallow
10.1 INTRODUCTION 231
10.2 AN OVERVIEW OF REPORTED CASES INVOLVING THE EXPLOITATION OF MIGRANT WORKERS IN MALAYSIA 232
10.3 ABUSE CASES INVOLVING MIGRANT WORKERS IN MALAYSIA: THE LEGAL IMPACT 240
10.4 CONCLUSION 241
CHAPTER 11A
EXPLOITATION OF MIGRANT WORKERS: CRIMINAL SANCTIONS PROVIDED UNDER THE MALAYSIAN PENAL CODE
by Muazzaf Suhail Mailor

11A.1 INTRODUCTION 243
11A.2 AN OVERVIEW OF THE THEORY AND PRINCIPLES OF CRIMINAL LAW 244
11A.3 THE STANDARD COMMON LAW TEST OF CRIMINAL LIABILITY: ACTUS NON FACTI REUM NISI MENS SIT REA 249
11A.3.1 Actus reus 250
11A.3.1.1 Act 251
11A.3.1.2 Omission 252
11A.3.2 Mens rea 256
11A.4 EXPLOITATION OF MIGRANT WORKERS: CRIMINAL SANCTIONS PROVIDED UNDER THE MALAYSIAN PENAL CODE 260
11A.4.1 Possible Sanctions under the Malaysian Penal Code (Act 574) 260
11A.4.2 Case Study Involving Migrant Workers which Had Been Tried by the Courts under the Penal Code 267
11A.4.3 Criminal Sentencing Principle in Malaysia 279
11A.6 CONCLUSION 280

CHAPTER 11B
CRIMINAL OFFENCES AND CIVIL WRONGS BY OR AGAINST MIGRANT WORKERS
by Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed

11B.1 PHYSICAL ABUSE OR ILL-TREATMENT OF MIGRANT WORKERS: THE PUNISHMENT 281
11B.2 OFFENCES AGAINST MIGRANT WORKERS: ILLUSTRATION FROM DECIDED CASES 284
11B.3 A REVIEW OF SELECTED CASES 289
11B.4 CONCLUSION 306

CHAPTER 12
EXPLOITATION OF NATIONAL OR LOCAL WORKERS AND THE LIABILITY OF THE EMPLOYER
by Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed

12.1 INTRODUCTION 307
12.2 LABOUR IS NOT A COMMODITY 310
12.3 FORCED LABOUR PROHIBITED 311
12.4 RELATIONSHIP OF MUTUAL TRUST AND CONFIDENCE 315
12.5 EMPLOYEES' RIGHTS IN EMPLOYMENT AKIN TO 'PROPERTY RIGHTS' 317
12.5.1 Withholding of Salary or Failure of Salary Payment 318
12.5.2 Demotion or Reduction in Status and Rank 320
12.5.3 Transfer of Employee 322
12.5.4 Secondment Must Be Bona Fide 326
| 12.5.5 | Retrenchment Justifiable on Genuine Commercial Reasons | 329 |
| 12.5.6 | Outsourcing to Victimise Employee | 331 |
| 12.5.7 | Voluntary Separation Scheme Being Forced or Coerced on Employee | 332 |
| 12.5.8 | Other Circumstances | 334 |

| 12.6 | CONSTRUCTIVE DISMISSAL AND REMEDIES | 335 |
| 12.6.1 | Constructive Dismissal | 335 |
| 12.6.2 | Remedies for Dismissal without Just Cause or Excuse | 340 |

| 12.7 | CONCLUSION | 342 |

| 13.6 | CASES ON NON-RENEWAL OF FIXED-TERM CONTRACTS INVOLVING MIGRANT WORKERS | 360 |
| 13.7 | CONCLUSION | 368 |

CHAPTER 14
MIGRANT WORKERS: ADEQUACY AND SUFFICIENCY OF LAW
by Farheen Baig Sardar Baig

| 14.1 | INTRODUCTION | 369 |
| 14.2 | MIGRANT WORKERS' ACCESS TO JUSTICE | 370 |
| 14.3 | ADEQUACY AND SUFFICIENCY OF THE LAW | 374 |
| 14.4 | PROBLEMS FACED BY MIGRANT WORKERS | 378 |
| 14.4.1 | Discriminatory Wages | 378 |
| 14.4.2 | Inadequate Housing | 379 |
| 14.4.3 | Insurance | 379 |
| 14.4.4 | Medical Facilities | 379 |
| 14.4.5 | Cancellation of Work Permits | 380 |
| 14.4.6 | High Costs for Renewing Work Passes | 380 |
| 14.4.7 | Other Related Problems | 381 |
| 14.5 | RECOMMENDATIONS | 382 |
| 14.6 | ESTABLISHING MIGRANT WORKERS' RIGHTS: ITS IMPORTANCE | 385 |
| 14.7 | CONCLUSION | 388 |

CHAPTER 13
PREMATURE TERMINATION OF FIXED-TERM CONTRACT AND ITS REMEDIES
by Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed

| 13.1 | INTRODUCTION | 343 |
| 13.2 | FIXED-TERM ENGAGEMENT ON GENUINE GROUNDS | 347 |
| 13.3 | LEGITIMATE EXPECTATION OF RENEWAL OF FIXED-TERM ENGAGEMENT | 350 |
| 13.4 | COMPENSATION FOR PREMATURE TERMINATION OF FIXED-TERM CONTRACT | 356 |
| 13.5 | HIRING MIGRANT WORKERS OR EXPATRIATES ON FIXED-TERM CONTRACT | 358 |

| 13.6 | CASES ON NON-RENEWAL OF FIXED-TERM CONTRACTS INVOLVING MIGRANT WORKERS | 360 |
| 13.7 | CONCLUSION | 368 |
CHAPTER 15
ASYLUM SEEKERS AND THE RIGHT TO WORK
by Mohammad Nazib Ishan Jan

15.1 INTRODUCTION 389
15.2 THE DEFINITIONS OF ASYLUM AND ASYLUM SEEKERS 391
15.2.1 Definition of Asylum 391
15.2.2 Definition of Asylum Seeker 393
15.3 PROTECTION TO ASYLUM SEEKERS EASIER SAID THAN DONE 394
15.4 CLASSIFICATION OF ASYLUM 395
15.4.1 Territorial Asylum 396
15.4.2 Extra-Territorial or Diplomatic Asylum 399
15.5 THE RIGHT TO WORK: IS IT AVAILABLE UNDER INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW TO ASYLUM SEEKERS 404
15.6 THE RIGHT TO WORK: IS IT AVAILABLE TO ASYLUM SEEKERS IN MALAYSIA? 412
15.7 CONCLUSION 414

CHAPTER 16
HUMAN TRAFFICKING AND SMUGGLING OF MIGRANTS: THE INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS AND DOMESTIC LAWS OF MALAYSIA
by Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed

16.1 INTRODUCTION 415
16.2 HUMAN TRAFFICKING: THE INSTRUMENTS 416
16.2.1 United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime 416
16.2.2 Malaysian Anti-Trafficking in Persons and Anti-Smuggling of Migrants Act 2007 (Act 670) 430
16.3 DECIDED CASES OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING: A REVIEW 454
16.4 ISLAMIC APPROACH TO HUMAN TRAFFICKING 475
16.5 CONCLUSION 477

CHAPTER 17
DILIGENCE AND TRUSTWORTHINESS: THE QUALITIES OF A MUSLIM EMPLOYEE
by Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed

17.1 INTRODUCTION 489
17.2 EMPLOY HIM WHO IS STRONG AND TRUSTWORTHY 493
17.3 CONCLUSION 504

CHAPTER 18
IMMIGRATION LAW, RULES AND PROCEDURE FOR MIGRANT WORKERS: A COMPARATIVE STUDY FROM VARIOUS JURISDICTIONS
by Muzaffar Syah Mallow

18.1 INTRODUCTION 507
18.2 IMMIGRATION LAW, RULES AND PROCEDURE FOR MIGRANT WORKERS UNDER VARIOUS JURISDICTIONS 510
18.2.1 United States of America 511
18.2.2 United Kingdom 516
18.2.3 Australia 519
18.2.4 Hong Kong 520
18.2.5 Singapore 525
18.2.6 Saudi Arabia 527
Contents

18.3 THE ISSUES ON THE EXPLOITATION OF MIGRANT WORKERS IN SINGAPORE, SAUDI ARABIA & HONG KONG 528

18.4 CONCLUSION 532

CHAPTER 19
THE LAW ON MINIMUM WAGES IN MALAYSIA
by Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed

19.1 INTRODUCTION 533

19.2 MINIMUM WAGE FIXING CONVENTION, 1970 (NO. 131) 534

19.3 MINIMUM WAGE FIXING RECOMMENDATION, 1970 (NO. 135) 536

19.4 MINIMUM RATE OF WAGES FROM ISLAMIC PERSPECTIVE 539

19.5 MINIMUM WAGE LAW IN SELECTED COUNTRIES 541

19.6 MINIMUM WAGES ORDER 2012 (MALAYSIA) 545

19.7 APPLICATION OF MINIMUM WAGES ORDER: AN EMPLOYEE UNDER A CONTRACT OF SERVICE 546

19.7.1 The Rates of Minimum Wages 549

19.7.2 Council to Review Minimum Wages Order 553

19.7.3 Negotiation for Restructuring of Wages 553

19.7.4 Enforcement of the Minimum Wages Order 554

19.7.5 Compounding of Offences 555

19.7.6 Protection of Informers or Whistleblowers 556

19.7.7 Implementation of Minimum Wages Order: The Guidelines 557

APPENDICES 579

Appendix A 579

Appendix B 582

Appendix BA 599

Appendix C 619

Appendix CA 628

Appendix D 637

Appendix E 676

Appendix F 682

INDEX 697
PREMATURE TERMINATION OF FIXED-TERM CONTRACT AND ITS REMEDIES*

13.1 INTRODUCTION

Generally, a worker has, unless removed earlier on valid grounds, a legitimate expectation to continue in his employment for as long as he is able to work up to the normal retirement age. An impending dismissal or termination from employment should be based on just cause or excuse. In fact, the courts have equated job security akin to ‘property right’. For example, in *Hong Leong Equipment Sdn Bhd v. Liew Fook Chuan and Anor*, Gopal Sri Ram JCA stated:

The legislature has ... provided for security of tenure and equated the right to be engaged in gainful employment to a proprietary right which may not be forfeited save, and except, for just cause or excuse.

Further, the courts have also stated that a person’s right to livelihood is protected in the Federal Constitution, art. 5(1). Hence, once a person is retained in employment, he cannot be removed ‘until something occurs (including redundancy) which justifies terminating it.’

---

* This Chapter is contributed by Ashgar Ali Ali Mohamed.


2 See, for example, *R Rama Chandran v. The Industrial Court of Malaysia and Anor* [1997] 1 CLJ 147 (FC); *Hong Leong Equipment Sdn Bhd v. Liew Fook Chuan* (supra); *Tan Tek Seng v. Suruhanjaya Perkhidmatan Pendidikan and Anor* [1996] 2 CLJ 771 (CA); and *Harris Solid State (M) Sdn Bhd and Anor v Bruno Gentil Pereira and Ors* [1996] 4 CLJ 747 (CA). The Federal Court however, had in *Pihak Berkas Negeri Sabah v. Sugumar Balakrishnan & Another Appeal* [2002] 4 CLJ 105, disapproved the liberal interpretation of ‘right to life’ in art. 5(1) to include ‘right to livelihood.’