TA’WIL MUKHTALIF AL-ḤADITH
AN ANNOTATED TRANSLATION

CHE AMNAH BAHARI

IIUM Press
TA’WĪL MUKHTALIF AL-ḤADĪTH:
AN ANNOTATED TRANSLATION

Che Amnah Bahari

IIUM Press
Contents

Preface ix
Acknowledgements xi
Technical Notes xiii
Abbreviations xv

Introduction 1

Translation of Ta’wil Mukhtalif al-Hadīth 29

Chapter One
The People of Kalām and the People of Ra’ī
A. (Reproaches Addressed Against Them) 41
B. Scholars of the People of Kalām
   I. Ibrāhīm Sayyār al-Naṣzām 45
   II. Abū al-Hudhayl al-‘Allāf 75
   III. ‘Ubayd Allāh ibn al-Ḥasan 77
   IV. Bakr al-‘Ammī 79
   V. Hishām ibn al-Ḥakām 80
   VI. Thumāmah 81
   VII. Muḥammad ibn al-Jahm al-Barmakī 82
   VIII. Aḥšāb al-Ra’ī 84
   IX. Al-Jaḥiẓ 93
C. Caution on the People of Kalām 95
D. The Exegesis of the People of Kalām and the People of Ra’ī 103
E. The Exegesis of the Rāfiḍītes 107

Chapter Two
The People of Ḥadīth
   I. Ḥadīth Criticism 113
   II. The Misuse of Ḥadīth by the People of Ḥadīth 120
Chapter Three

Allegation of *Ahadīth* Said to Contradict al-Qur’ān; *Ahadīth* Invalidated by *Naẓar, Hujjah al-‘Aql* (Reason), *‘Iyān* (Experience), *Khabar, Ijmā‘* (Consensus) and *Qiyās* (Analogy)

I. Example of *Hadīth* Said to Contradict al-Qur’ān 129
II. Example of Two Contradictory *Hadīth* 133
III. Example of Two Contradictory *Hadīth* 134
IV. Example of Two Contradictory *Hadīth* 136
V. Example of *Hadīth* that Contradicts the Book of Almighty Allāh 137
VI. Example of *Hadīth* Invalidated by Consensus 139
VII. Example of *Hadīth* Said to be Invalidated by *Naẓar* (assumption) and Reason 141
VIII. Example of *Hadīth* Said to be Invalidated by Experience (*‘Iyān*) 144
IX. Example of *Hadīth* Invalidated by *Naẓar* and Reason (*Hujjah al-‘Aql*) 145
X. Example of Two Contradictory *Hadīth* 147
XI. Example of Two Contradictory *Hadīth* 154
XII. Example of Two Contradictory *Hadīth* 156
XIII. Example of a Contradictory *Hadīth* 160
XIV. Example of Two Contradictory *Hadīth* 162
XV. Example of Two Contradictory *Hadīth* 164
XVI. Example of *Hadīth* Invalidated by al-Qur’ān 166
XVII. Example of *Hadīth* Invalidated al-Qur’ān 167
XVIII. Example of *Hadīth* Said to be Invalidated by *Naẓar, ‘Iyān, Sunnah and al-Qur’ān* 169
XIX. Example of Two Contradictory *Hadīth* 171
XX. Example of *Hadīth* Invalidated by *Naẓar and Khabar* 172
XXI. Examples of Two Contradictory *Hadīth* 178
XXII. Example of *Hadīth* which Contradicts in Its Beginning and Ending 181
XXIII. Example of *Hadīth* Said to be Invalid in Its Beginning and Ending 183
XXIV. Example of Hadīth Said to Have an Internal Contradiction 184
XXV. Example of Hadīth Said to be Invalid in Its Beginning and Ending 189
XXVI. Example of Hadīth Invalidated by Nazar 194
XXVII. Example of Hadīth Said to be Invalidated by the Analogical Reasoning 199
XXVIII. Example of Two Contradictory Hadīth 201
XXIX. Example of Hadīth Said to be Invalidated by the Book and Nazar 202
XXX. Example of Two Contradictory Hadīth 208
XXXI. Example of Two Contradictory Hadīth 209
XXXII. Example of Hadīth Said to be Invalidated by Nazar and Khabar 211
XXXIII. Example of Two Contradictory Hadīth 219
XXXIV. Example of Two Contradictory Hadīth 221
XXXV. Example of Two Contradictory Hadīth 223
XXXVI. Example of Two Contradictory Hadīth 227
XXXVII. Example of Two Contradictory Hadīth 231
XXXVIII. Example of Two Contradictory Hadīth 233
XXXIX. Example of Hadīth Said to be Invalidated by Reason and Nazar 236
XL. Example of Hadīth Said to be Invalidated by Reason and Nazar 236
XLII. Example of Two Contradictory Hadīth 248
XLIII. Example of Two Contradictory Hadīth 250
XI,IV. Example of Judgement on Rajm or Lapidation Refuted by al-Qur'an 254
XLV. Example of the Judgment on Wasīyyah or will Injunction Refuted by al-Qur'ān 256
XLVI. Example of Judgment on Marriage said to be Refuted by al-Qur'ān 257
XLVII. Example of Contradictory Hadīth on the Judgment of Ghusl on Friday 264
XLVIII. Example of Hadīth Invalidated by Ḥiyān (Experience) 266
| LXIX. | Example of *Hadīth* Invalidated by al-Qur’ān | 268 |
| L. | Example of *Hadīth* Invalidated by al-Qur’ān and Consensus | 269 |
| LI. | Example of an Incompatible *Hadīth* (in Its Beginning and Ending) | 270 |
| LII. | Example of *Hadīth* Invalidated by al-Qur’ān and Reasoning | 271 |
| LIII. | Example of Anthropomorphic *Hadīth* Invalidated by al-Qur’ān and Reasoning | 276 |
| LIV. | Example of Anthropomorphic *Hadīth* | 278 |
| LV. | Example of Anthropomorphic *Hadīth* | 279 |
| LVI. | Example of Anthropomorphic *Hadīth* | 280 |
| LVII. | Example of Anthropomorphic *Hadīth* | 281 |
| LVIII. | Example of Anthropomorphic *Hadīth* | 283 |
| LIX. | Example of Anthropomorphic *Hadīth* | 284 |
| LX. | Example of Anthropomorphic *Hadīth* | 284 |
| LXI. | Example of Anthropomorphic *Hadīth* | 287 |
| LXII. | Example of Anthropomorphic *Hadīth* | 291 |
| LXIII. | Example of Anthropomorphic *Hadīth* | 292 |
| LXIV. | Example of Anthropomorphic *Hadīth* | 294 |
| LXV. | Example of *Hadīth* Invalidated by Consensus and the Book | 295 |
| LXVI. | Example of Two Contradictory *Hadīth* | 297 |
| LXVII. | Example of Two Contradictory *Hadīth* | 298 |
| LXVIII. | Example of *Hadīth* Invalidated by *Nazar* | 299 |
| LXIX. | Example of *Hadīth* Applied by the Rāfīḍites to Accuse the Companions of Muhammad as Infidels | 304 |
| LXX. | Example of *Hadīth* on Predestination | 307 |
| LXXI. | Example of *Hadīth* Invalidated by *Nazar* | 309 |
| LXXII. | Examples of Contradictory *Aḥādīth* that are Related to Prayer | 310 |
| LXXIII. | Example of Contradictory *Aḥādīth* that are Related to Ablution | 313 |
| LXXIV. | Example of Contradictory *Hadīth* | 316 |
LXXV. Example of Contradictory Hadīth on Fasting 316

LXXVI. Example of Contradictory Hadīth on Fasting 317

LXXVII. Example of Hadīth Invalidated by Naṣār 318

LXXVIII. Example of Hadīth Invalidated by al-Qur'ān from Two Perspectives 319

LXXIX. Example of Hadīth Invalidated by Naṣār 330

LXXX. Example of Hadīth Invalidated by Naṣār 332

LXXXI. Example of Hadīth Vindicating the Createdness of al-Qur'ān 334

LXXXII. Example of Hadīth Invalidated by Consensus 337

LXXXIII. Example of Two Contradictory Hadīth Related to the Children of the Polytheist 341

LXXXIV. Example of Contradictory Hadīth 342

LXXXV. Example of Hadīth Invalidated by Naṣār 347

LXXXVI. Example of Anthropomorphic Hadīth Invalidated by al-Qur'ān and Consensus 349

LXXXVII. Example of Hadīth Invalidated by Naṣār 356

LXXXVIII. Example of Hadīth Invalidated by Naṣār 359

LXXXIX. Example of Contradictory Hadīth 367

XC. Example of Two Contradictory hadīth 369

XCI. Example of contradictory Hadīth 372

XCII. Example of Contradictory Hadīth 379

XCIII. Example of Hadīth Invalidated by al-Qur'ān 382

XCIV. Example of Contradictory Hadīth 389

XCV. Example of Hadīth Invalidated by al-Qur'ān and Reason 394

CVI. Example of Hadīth Invalidated by al-Qur'ān and Reason 400

XCVII. Example of Hadīth Invalidated by Naṣār 406

XCVIII. Example of Two Contradictory Hadīth 407

XCIX. Example of Hadīth Invalidated by Consensus and the Book 409
C. Example of Hadīth Invalidated by Reason 410
CI. Example of Two Contradictory Hadīth 414
CII. Example of Contradictory Hadīth on Drinking of Water 419
CIII. Example of Contradictory Hadīth on Impure Water 421
CIV. Example of Contradictory Hadīth on Hajj 422
CV. Example of Hadīth Invalidated by Reason 423
CVI. Example of Two Contradictory Hadīth on Transaction 427
CVII. Example of Two Contradictory Hadīth on Menstruation 429
CVIII. Example of Hadīth Invalidated by Reason 430
CVIV. Example of Hadīth Invalidated by Nazar 433

Bibliography 435