

TA'WIL MUKHTALIF AL-HADITH

AN ANNOTATED TRANSLATION

CHE AMNAH BAHARI

قال رسول الله ﷺ

أَسْأَلُكَ غِنَايَ وَغِنَى مَوْلَايَ

قال رسول الله ﷺ

اللَّهُمَّ أَحْيِنِي مَسْكِينًا وَأَمِتْنِي مَسْكِينًا

قال رسول الله ﷺ

مَنْ قَالَ لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا اللَّهُ دَخَلَ الْجَنَّةَ

قال رسول الله ﷺ

لَا يَزِينِي الزَّانِي حِينَ يَزِينِي وَهُوَ مُؤْمِنٌ



IIUM Press

LIBRARY
INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY MALAYSIA

TA'WĪL MUKHTALIF
AL-ḤADĪTH:
AN ANNOTATED
TRANSLATION

Che Amnah Bahari



IIUM Press

Published by:
IIUM Press
International Islamic University Malaysia

Copy no: 11122983
Initial: AZS
Date: 13/10/09
Location: MAIS / PJ / ISTAC / NILAI / K / K2 / IIBF

First Edition, 2009
©IIUM Press, IIUM

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without any prior written permission of the publisher.

Perpustakaan Negara Malaysia

Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

Ta'wil Mukhtalif al-Hadith: An Annotated Translation/
Che Amnah Bahari
Bibliography: p. 435
ISBN 978-983-3855-89-6

ISBN: 978-983-3855-89-6

Contents

Preface	ix
Acknowledgements	xi
Technical Notes	xiii
Abbreviations	xv
Introduction	1
Translation of <i>Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth</i>	29
Chapter One	
The People of <i>Kalām</i> and the People of <i>Ra'y</i>	
A. (Reproaches Addressed Against Them)	41
B. Scholars of the People of <i>Kalām</i>	
I. Ibrāhīm Sayyār al-Nazzām	45
II. Abū al-Hudhayl al-'Allāf	75
III. 'Ubayd Allāh ibn al-Ḥasan	77
IV. Bakr al-'Ammi	79
V. Hishām ibn al-Ḥakam	80
VI. Thumāmah	81
VII. Muḥammad ibn al-Jahm al-Barmakī	82
VIII. Aṣḥāb al-Ra'y	84
IX. Al-Jāḥiẓ	93
C. Caution on the People of <i>Kalām</i>	95
D. The Exegesis of the People of <i>Kalām</i> and the People of <i>Ra'y</i>	103
E. The Exegesis of the Rāfiḍites	107
Chapter Two	
The People of <i>Ḥadīth</i>	
I. <i>Ḥadīth</i> Criticism	113
II. The Misuse of <i>Ḥadīth</i> by the People of <i>Ḥadīth</i>	120

Chapter Three

Allegation of *Aḥadīth* Said to Contradict al-Qur'ān;
Aḥadīth Invalidated by *Nazar*, *Hujjah al-'Aql* (Reason),
'*Iyān* (Experience), *Khabar*, *Ijmā'* (Consensus)
and *Qiyās* (Analogy)

I.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Said to Contradict al-Qur'ān	129
II.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	133
III.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	134
IV.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	136
V.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> that Contradicts the Book of Almighty Allāh	137
VI.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by Consensus	139
VII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Said to be Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i> (assumption) and Reason	141
VIII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Said to be Invalidated by Experience (' <i>Iyān</i>)	144
IX.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i> and Reason (<i>Hujjah al-'Aql</i>)	145
X.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	147
XI.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	154
XII.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	156
XIII.	Example of a Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	160
XIV.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	162
XV.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	164
XVI.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by al-Qur'ān	166
XVII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated al-Qur'ān	167
XVIII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Said to be Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i> , ' <i>Iyān</i> , <i>Sunnah</i> and al-Qur'ān	169
XIX.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	171
XX.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i> and <i>Khabar</i>	172
XXI.	Examples of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	178
XXII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> which Contradicts in Its Beginning and Ending	181
XXIII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Said to be Invalid in Its Beginning and Ending	183

XXIV.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Said to Have an Internal Contradiction	184
XXV.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Said to be Invalid in Its Beginning and Ending	189
XXVI.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	194
XXVII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Said to be Invalidated by the Analogical Reasoning	199
XXVIII.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	201
XXIX.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Said to be Invalidated by the Book and <i>Nazar</i>	202
XXX.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	208
XXXI.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	209
XXXII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Said to be Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i> and <i>Khabar</i>	211
XXXIII.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	219
XXXIV.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	221
XXXV.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	223
XXXVI.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	227
XXXVII.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	231
XXXVIII.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	233
XXXIX.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	234
XL.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Said to be Invalidated by Reason and <i>Nazar</i>	236
XLI.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	248
XLII.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	250
XLIII.	Example of Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	251
XLIV.	Example of Judgement on <i>Rajm</i> or Lapidation Refuted by al-Qur'ān	254
XLV.	Example of the Judgment on <i>Waṣiyyah</i> or will Injunction Refuted by al-Qur'ān	256
XLVI.	Example of Judgment on Marriage said to be Refuted by al-Qur'ān	257
XLVII.	Example of Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i> on the Judgment of <i>Ghusl</i> on Friday	264
XLVIII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by ' <i>Iyān</i> (Experience)	266

XLIX.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by al-Qur'ān	268
L.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by al-Qur'ān and Consensus	269
LI.	Example of an Incompatible <i>Ḥadīth</i> (in Its Beginning and Ending)	270
LII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by al-Qur'ān and Reasoning	271
LIII.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by al-Qur'ān and Reasoning	276
LIV.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i>	278
LV.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i>	279
LVI.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i>	280
LVII.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i>	281
LVIII.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i>	283
LIX.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i>	284
LX.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>ḥadīth</i>	284
LXI.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i>	287
LXII.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i>	291
LXIII.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i>	292
LXIV.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i>	294
LXV.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by Consensus and the Book	295
LXVI.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	297
LXVII.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	298
LXVIII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	299
LXIX.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Applied by the Rāfiḍites to Accuse the Companions of Muḥammad as Infidels	304
LXX.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> on Predestination	307
LXXI.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	309
LXXII.	Examples of Contradictory <i>Aḥādīth</i> that are Related to Prayer	310
LXXIII.	Example of Contradictory <i>Aḥādīth</i> that are Related to Ablution	313
LXXIV.	Example of Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	316

LXXV.	Example of Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i> on Fasting	316
LXXVI.	Example of Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i> on Fasting	317
LXXVII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	318
LXXVIII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by al-Qur'ān from Two Perspectives	319
LXXIX.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	330
LXXX.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	332
LXXXI.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Vindicating the Createdness of al-Qur'ān	334
LXXXII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by Consensus	337
LXXXIII.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i> Related to the Children of the Polytheist	341
LXXXIV.	Example of Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	342
LXXXV.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	347
LXXXVI.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by al-Qur'ān and Consensus	349
LXXXVII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	356
LXXXVIII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	359
LXXXIX.	Example of Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	367
XC.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>ḥadīth</i>	369
XCI.	Example of contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	372
XCII.	Example of Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	379
XCIII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by al-Qur'ān	382
XCIV.	Example of Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	389
XC.V.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by al-Qur'ān and Reason	394
CVI.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by al-Qur'ān and Reason	400
XC.VII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	406
XC.VIII.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	407
XCIX.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by Consensus and the Book	409

C.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by Reason	410
CI.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	414
CII.	Example of Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i> on Drinking of Water	419
CIII.	Example of Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i> on Impure Water	421
CIV.	Example of Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i> on <i>Ḥajj</i>	422
CV.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by Reason	423
CVI.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i> on Transaction	427
CVII.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i> on Menstruation	429
CVIII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by Reason	430
CVIV.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	433
Bibliography		435