Contemporary Issues on Matrimonial Property

Edited by:
Zuhairah Ariff Abd Ghadas
Norliyah Ibrahim

IIUM PRESS
INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY MALAYSIA
CONTEMPORARY ISSUES ON MATRIMONIAL PROPERTY

Edited by:

ZUHAIRAH ARIFF ABD GHADAS
NORLIAH IBRAHIM

Ahmad Ibrahim Kulliyyah Of Laws (AIKOL)
International Islamic University Malaysia

IIUM Press
CONTENTS

Authors' Profile .................................................................................. i
Foreword ............................................................................................ v
Contents ............................................................................................ vii

Chapter 1
Relationship Property In New Zealand; The Illusion Of Equality
- Mark Henaghan

1.0 Introduction .................................................................................. 1
1.1 Equal Sharing of Property does not achieve equality ... 5
1.2 A Partnership of Equal ................................................................. 6
1.3 Achieving an Equal Result ........................................................... 9
1.4 Objections to the Disparity Provisions ................................. 10
1.5 How the Disparity Provision Works ........................................ 11
1.6 The Conundrums of Compensation ........................................ 13
1.6.1 What is it for? ...................................................................... 13
1.6.2 How to compensate? ............................................................... 19
1.6.3 How much? ........................................................................ 21

Chapter 2
The Courts of Appeal in Malaysia and Singapore of the fairest division of matrimonial assets upon divorce
- Leong Wai Kum

2.0 Introduction ................................................................................ 27
2.1 Historical Connections and Basis For Comparisons.... 28
  2.1.1 Proposals of Enactment ................................. 28
  2.1.2 Original Enactments of Power ............................. 29
    2.1.2.1 Malaysia ........................................ 29
    2.1.2.2 Singapore ........................................ 31
    2.1.2.3 Brilliancy of Enactment ............................. 31
  2.1.3 Legislative Improvement in Singapore .................... 34
    2.1.3.1 Infelicities in wording of provision ................. 34
    2.1.3.2 Amendment in Singapore removed
            infelicities in wording while retaining
            core strength of statutory provision ......... 39
  2.1.4 Malaysian Section 76 and Singaporean Section
      112 share same core ideas ................................ 42
    2.1.4.1 Powers in Malaysian and Singaporean
            courts necessary to supplement general
            principles of property law ....................... 42
    2.1.4.2 Powers in Malaysian and Singaporean
            courts to make fairest division of
            matrimonial assets ............................... 43
  2.2 Lessons Possible in Both Directions Across the Johore
        Straits.................................................. 44
  2.3 Decisions of the Court of Appeal in Malaysia and
        Singapore ................................................ 49
    2.3.1 Short Summary of Decisions of Court of Appeal
            in Malaysia ........................................ 49
    2.3.2 Short Summary of Decisions of Court of Appeal
            in Singapore ........................................ 55
    2.3.2.1 Court of Appeal in Singapore varied the
            lower court’s order .............................. 56
    2.3.2.2 Court of Appeal in Singapore approved
            lower court’s order .............................. 63
  2.4 Lessons From Decision of the Courts of Appeal ....... 68
    2.4.1 Underlying Purpose of power to give due credit
            to non-financial role ............................. 69
    2.4.1.1 Property law does not credit non-financial
            effort ............................................. 69
2.4.1.2 Power only exercisable over properties closely connected with marital relationship ..... 70
2.4.1.3 Family law must recognize realities of family dynamics ................................. 71
2.4.1.4 Family law gives equal value to financial and non-financial roles in order to treat both spouses equally ........................................... 71
2.4.1.5 Deferred community of property conveys all these Propositions ......................... 72

2.4.2 Fair Division Revolves Around Equal Division ...74
2.4.2.1 Majority of orders of equal division .... 74
2.4.2.2 Courts of Appeal vary lower court orders to be closer to equal division .......... 76
2.4.2.3 Close to equality of division .............. 77

2.5 Conclusion ........................................................................... 78

Chapter 3
Prenuptial Agreement: A Contemporary Legal Issue
In The Spirit Of Unification In Marital Law
- Faizal Kurniawan & Erni Agustin

3.0 Introduction ........................................................................ 81
3.1 Juridical Characteristic of Prenuptial Agreement ........... 83
3.2 The Limitation of Prenuptial Agreement Substance in accordance with Act No. 1/1974 ........................................ 86
3.2.1 Prenuptial Agreement in BW .................................. 90
3.2.2 Prenuptial Agreement in Islamic Law
Compilation ........................................................................ 93
3.3 The Legal Effects of Breaching the Prenuptial Agreement towards Marriage ........................................ 94
3.4 Conclusion ........................................................................ 98
Chapter 4
‘Mersher Order’ in Protecting The Children’s Right Not to Lose A Roof Over Their Head After a Divorce: Malaysian Experience
- Norliah Ibrahim

4.0 Introduction ................................................................. 99
4.1 Matrimonial Home and the Spouse’s Right of Occupation ........................................ 100
4.2 Matrimonial Home After Dissolution of Marriage ........ 102
4.3 Provision on Matrimonial Property in Malaysia .......... 103
4.3.1 Law Reform (Marriage And Divorce) Act 1976 .................................................. 103
4.4 Matrimonial Home as a Matrimonial Property .......... 105
4.5 ‘Mersher Order’ in England ........................................... 107
4.6 ‘Mersher Order’ in Malaysia ......................................... 108
4.7 Conclusion ...................................................................... 111

Chapter 5
Guardianship Of A Child’s Property Acquired Via Succession: A Malaysian Perspective
- Akmal Hidayah Halim

5.0 Introduction ................................................................. 113
5.1 Entitlements of a Child under the Malaysian Law of Succession ........................................ 114
5.2 Power of Court Relating to Estate Dispositions ........... 116
5.3 Appointment of Guardian ad litem ................................. 117
5.4 Administration of a child’s property acquired via succession .................................................. 119
5.5 Administration of Undistributed Fund ......................... 120
5.6 Guardianship of a child’s property ............................... 122
5.7 Powers and Removal of a Guardian ......................... 124
5.7.1 Power of a Guardian over immovable and movable property ....................................... 124
5.7.2 Limitation of Guardian’s power .................................. 126
5.7.3 Removal of a Guardian ............................................. 126
5.8 Conclusion .................................................................. 127

Chapter 6
Human Capital as Matrimonial Property
- Norliah Ibrahim & Najbah Mohd Zin

6.0 Introduction ................................................................ 129
6.1 Definition and Significance of Human Capital .................. 130
6.2 The reluctance to include human capital as matrimonial
   property ........................................................................ 132
6.3 Court's Approach ....................................................... 134
6.4 Discussion on a few decided cases ................................. 136
6.5 Conclusion .................................................................. 140

Chapter 7
Business Assets As Matrimonial Property: Implication for
Family Policy
- Zuhairah Ariff Abd Ghadas & Norliah Ibrahim

7.0 Introduction ................................................................ 141
7.1 Definition of matrimonial property (harta
   sepencarian) .................................................................. 142
7.2 The law on matrimonial property in Malaysia ............... 146
   7.2.1 Law Reform (Marriage and Divorce) Act
   1976 ....................................................................... 147
7.3 Interest in business ..................................................... 149
   7.3.1 Business Assets ..................................................... 150
   7.3.2 Management rights ............................................... 153
7.4 Observation .................................................................. 159
Chapter 8
Mediation in Matrimonial Property Dispute: the Practice in Malaysia
- Nora Abdul Hak

8.0 Introduction.............................................................. 161
8.1 Mediation in Family Disputes................................. 162
8.2 Mediation and Matrimonial Property Disputes in Malaysia ................................................................. 164
8.2.1 Institutions Offering Mediation Service in Malaysia ................................................................. 164
8.2.2 Legal Provisions on Mediation ......................... 167
8.2.2.1 Law Reform (Marriage & Divorce) Act, 1976 ................................................................. 167
8.2.2.2 Legal Aid Act, 1971 ........................................ 169
8.2.2.3 Islamic Family Law Act/Enactment .... 170
8.2.2.4 Syariah Court Civil Procedure (Selangor) Enactment, 2003 ................................................. 172
8.2.2.5 The Sulh Work Manual, Department of Syariah Judiciary, Malaysia 2002 and The Sulh Officer Ethical Code, JKSM 2002 ................................................................. 174
8.2.3 Matrimonial Property Disputes in the Malaysian Courts ................................................................. 175
8.3 Family Mediation in other Jurisdictions .................... 179
8.4 Conclusion ................................................................. 183

Chapter 9
Law of trust and the beneficial interest in matrimonial property
- Zurai dah Ali & Zuhairah Ariff Abd Ghadas

9.0 Introduction.............................................................. 185
9.1 The Concept of Trust and Matrimonial Property ......... 186
9.1.1 Resulting Trust ....................................................... 188
9.1.2 Constructive Trust ................................................ 193
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>Proprietary Estoppel</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CHAPTER 10**

Legal Justification in Diving Matrimonial Property During Marriage

- *Wan Nur Aini Wan Ahmad Affandi & Nora Abdul Hak*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>The Law in Malaysia</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1.1</td>
<td>Polygamous Marriage</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1.2</td>
<td>Bankruptcy</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>The Law in Singapore</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.1</td>
<td>Question or Dispute Between Spouses as to the Title or Possession of a Property</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.2</td>
<td>Bankruptcy</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>The Law in Australia</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.1</td>
<td>Bankruptcy</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.2</td>
<td>Nuptial Settlement</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.3</td>
<td>Financial Agreements</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4</td>
<td>Conflict of Interest Between the Married Spouse and the Partner of De Facto Relationship</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>The Law in New Zealand</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5.1</td>
<td>Failure to Maintain the Matrimonial Property properly and reasonably</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5.2</td>
<td>Bankruptcy</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5.3</td>
<td>Contracting Out</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5.4</td>
<td>Conflict of Interest Between The Married Spouse and The Partner of De Facto Relationship</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.6.1</td>
<td>Bankruptcy</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.6.2</td>
<td>Contractual Agreements: Nuptial Settlement, Financial Agreement, and Contracting Out</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.6.3</td>
<td>Polygamous Marriage and De Facto Relationship</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
10.6.4 Mismanagement of the Matrimonial Property ... 250
10.6.5 Dispute Between Spouses as to the Title or Possession of a Property ....................... 251
CHAPTER 10

LEGAL JUSTIFICATION IN DIVIDING MATRIMONIAL PROPERTY DURING MARRIAGE

Wan Nur Aini Wan Ahmad Affandi & Nora Abdul Hak

10.0 INTRODUCTION

Fundamentally, in every marriage there will be a joint effort of the spouses, whether overt or covert, in the accumulation of assets or; which are commonly called as matrimonial properties. These matrimonial properties may stand in the name of the husband or the wife, or in their joint names. In the English case of Wachtel vs Wachtel, Lord Denning M.R. said that:¹

“the phrase ‘family assets’ is a convenient short way of expressing an important concept. It refers to those things which are acquired by one or other or both of the parties, with the intention that they should be continuing provision for them and their children during their joint lives, and used for the benefit of the family as a whole.”

¹ [1973] 1 All ER, 829.