Contemporary Issues on Matrimonial Property

Edited by:
Zuhairah Ariff Abd Ghadas
Norliah Ibrahim

IIUM PRESS
INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY MALAYSIA
CONTEMPORARY ISSUES ON MATRIMONIAL PROPERTY

Edited by:

ZUHAIRAH ARIFF ABD GHADAS
NORLIAH IBRAHIM

Ahmad Ibrahim Kulliyyah Of Laws (AIKOL)
International Islamic University Malaysia

IIUM Press
CONTENTS

Authors' Profile .............................................................................. i
Foreword ......................................................................................... v
Contents ........................................................................................... vii

Chapter 1
Relationship Property In New Zealand; The Illusion Of Equality
- Mark Henaghan

1.0 Introduction .................................................................................. 1
1.1 Equal Sharing of Property does not achieve equality ... 5
1.2 A Partnership of Equal ................................................................. 6
1.3 Achieving an Equal Result ......................................................... 9
1.4 Objections to the Disparity Provisions .............................. 10
1.5 How the Disparity Provision Works ......................................... 11
1.6 The Conundrums of Compensation ...................................... 13
  1.6.1 What is it for? ................................................................. 13
  1.6.2 How to compensate? ....................................................... 19
  1.6.3 How much? ................................................................. 21

Chapter 2
The Courts of Appeal in Malaysia and Singapore of the fairest division of matrimonial assets upon divorce
- Leong Wai Kum

2.0 Introduction .................................................................................. 27
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Historical Connections and Basis For Comparisons</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.1</td>
<td>Proposals of Enactment</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2</td>
<td>Original Enactments of Power</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2.1</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2.2</td>
<td>Singapore</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2.3</td>
<td>Brilliance of Enactment</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.3</td>
<td>Legislative Improvement in Singapore</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.3.1</td>
<td>Infelicities in wording of provision</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.3.2</td>
<td>Amendment in Singapore removed infelicities in wording while retaining core strength of statutory provision</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.4</td>
<td>Malaysian Section 76 and Singaporean Section 112 share same core ideas</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.4.1</td>
<td>Powers in Malaysian and Singaporean courts necessary to supplement general principles of property law</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.4.2</td>
<td>Powers in Malaysian and Singaporean courts to make fairest division of matrimonial assets</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Lessons Possible in Both Directions Across the Johore Straits</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Decisions of the Court of Appeal in Malaysia and Singapore</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1</td>
<td>Short Summary of Decisions of Court of Appeal in Malaysia</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2</td>
<td>Short Summary of Decisions of Court of Appeal in Singapore</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2.1</td>
<td>Court of Appeal in Singapore varied the lower court’s order</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2.2</td>
<td>Court of Appeal in Singapore approved lower court’s order</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>Lessons From Decision of the Courts of Appeal</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.1</td>
<td>Underlying Purpose of power to give due credit to non-financial role</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.1.1</td>
<td>Property law does not credit non-financial effort</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.4.1.2 Power only exercisable over properties closely connected with marital relationship ...... 70
2.4.1.3 Family law must recognize realities of family dynamics ..................................... 71
2.4.1.4 Family law gives equal value to financial and non-financial roles in order to treat both spouses equally .......................................................... 71
2.4.1.5 Deferred community of property conveys all these Propositions ......................... 72
2.4.2 Fair Division Revolves Around Equal Division ...74
  2.4.2.1 Majority of orders of equal division .... 74
  2.4.2.2 Courts of Appeal vary lower court orders to be closer to equal division ............. 76
  2.4.2.3 Close to equality of division ............. 77
2.5 Conclusion ........................................................................................................... 78

Chapter 3
Prenuptial Agreement: A Contemporary Legal Issue In The Spirit Of Unification In Marital Law - Faizal Kurniawan & Erni Agustin

3.0 Introduction ........................................................................................................ 81
3.1 Juridical Characteristic of Prenuptial Agreement .......... 83
3.2 The Limitation of Prenuptial Agreement Substance in accordance with Act No. 1/1974 ........................................ 86
  3.2.1 Prenuptial Agreement in BW ......................... 90
  3.2.2 Prenuptial Agreement in Islamic Law Compilation ........................................... 93
3.3 The Legal Effects of Breaching the Prenuptial Agreement towards Marriage ................................. 94
3.4 Conclusion ........................................................................................................ 98
Chapter 4
‘Mershier Order’ in Protecting The Children’s Right Not to Lose A Roof Over Their Head After a Divorce: Malaysian Experience
- Norliah Ibrahim

4.0 Introduction ................................................................. 99
4.1 Matrimonial Home and the Spouse’s Right of Occupation ................................................................. 100
4.2 Matrimonial Home After Dissolution of Marriage .... 102
4.3 Provision on Matrimonial Property in Malaysia .......... 103
4.3.1 Law Reform (Marriage And Divorce) Act 1976 .................................................................................. 103
4.4 Matrimonial Home as a Matrimonial Property .......... 105
4.5 ‘Mershier Order’ in England ......................................... 107
4.6 ‘Mershier Order’ in Malaysia ......................................... 108
4.7 Conclusion ...................................................................... 111

Chapter 5
Guardianship Of A Child’s Property Acquired Via Succession: A Malaysian Perspective
- Akmal Hidayah Halim

5.0 Introduction .................................................................... 113
5.1 Entitlements of a Child under the Malaysian Law of Succession .......................................................... 114
5.2 Power of Court Relating to Estate Dispositions ......... 116
5.3 Appointment of Guardian ad litem .............................. 117
5.4 Administration of a child’s property acquired via succession ................................................................. 119
5.5 Administration of Undistributed Fund ......................... 120
5.6 Guardianship of a child’s property ............................... 122
5.7 Powers and Removal of a Guardian ......................... 124
5.7.1 Power of a Guardian over immovable and movable property ......................................................... 124
Chapter 6
Human Capital as Matrimonial Property
- Norliah Ibrahimm & Najibah Mohd Zin

6.0 Introduction ......................................................... 129
6.1 Definition and Significance of Human Capital ............... 130
6.2 The reluctance to include human capital as matrimonial
property ................................................................. 132
6.3 Court’s Approach ..................................................... 134
6.4 Discussion on a few decided cases ............................... 136
6.5 Conclusion ................................................................ 140

Chapter 7
Business Assets As Matrimonial Property: Implication for
Family Policy
- Zuhairah Ariff Abd Ghadas & Norliah Ibrahimm

7.0 Introduction ............................................................ 141
7.1 Definition of matrimonial property (harta
sepencarian) .................................................................. 142
7.2 The law on matrimonial property in Malaysia ............. 146
7.2.1 Law Reform (Marriage and Divorce) Act
1976 ........................................................................ 147
7.3 Interest in business .................................................... 149
7.3.1 Business Assets ...................................................... 150
7.3.2 Management rights ............................................... 153
7.4 Observation ............................................................ 159
Chapter 8
Mediation in Matrimonial Property Dispute: the Practice in Malaysia
   - Nora Abdul Hak

8.0 Introduction ........................................................................ 161
8.1 Mediation in Family Disputes .............................................. 162
8.2 Mediation and Matrimonial Property Disputes in Malaysia ............................................................ 164
   8.2.1 Institutions Offering Mediation Service in
         Malaysia ........................................................................ 164
   8.2.2 Legal Provisions on Mediation ................................. 167
         8.2.2.1 Law Reform (Marriage & Divorce) Act,
                 1976 ................................................................. 167
         8.2.2.2 Legal Aid Act, 1971 ................................. 169
         8.2.2.3 Islamic Family Law Act/Enactment .... 170
         8.2.2.4 Syariah Court Civil Procedure (Selangor)
                 Enactment, 2003 ........................................ 172
   8.2.5 The Sulh Work Manual, Department of
         Syariah Judiciary, Malaysia 2002 and The
         Sulh Officer Ethical Code, JKSM
         2002 ...................................................................... 174
   8.2.3 Matrimonial Property Disputes in the Malaysian
         Courts ................................................................. 175
8.3 Family Mediation in other Jurisdictions .......................... 179
8.4 Conclusion ................................................................. 183

Chapter 9
Law of trust and the beneficial interest in matrimonial property
   - Zuraidah Ali & Zuhairah Ariff Abd Ghadas

9.0 Introduction ........................................................................ 185
9.1 The Concept of Trust and Matrimonial Property ......... 186
   9.1.1 Resulting Trust ...................................................... 188
   9.1.2 Constructive Trust ................................................ 193
9.2 Proprietary Estoppel .............................................................. 196
9.3 Conclusion ............................................................................. 197

CHAPTER 10
Legal Justification in Dividing Matrimonial Property During Marriage
– Wan Nur Aini Wan Ahmad Affandi & Nora Abdul Hak

10.0 Introduction .......................................................................... 199
10.1 The Law in Malaysia ............................................................. 201
  10.1.1 Polygamous Marriage ..................................................... 201
  10.1.2 Bankruptcy ................................................................. 207
10.2 The Law in Singapore ............................................................ 212
  10.2.1 Question or Dispute Between Spouses as to the Title or Possession of a Property ................................................................. 212
  10.2.2 Bankruptcy ................................................................. 216
10.3 The Law in Australia .............................................................. 219
  10.3.1 Bankruptcy ................................................................. 220
  10.3.2 Nuptial Settlements ....................................................... 226
  10.3.3 Financial Agreements ................................................... 230
10.4 Conflict of Interest Between the Married Spouse and the Partner of De Facto Relationship ......................................................... 235
10.5 The Law in New Zealand ....................................................... 236
  10.5.1 Failure to Maintain the Matrimonial Property properly and reasonably ................................................................. 237
  10.5.2 Bankruptcy ................................................................. 239
  10.5.3 Contracting Out ............................................................ 240
  10.5.4 Conflict of Interest Between The Married Spouse and The Partner of De Facto Relationship ......................................................... 244
10.6 Conclusion ............................................................................. 246
  10.6.1 Bankruptcy ................................................................. 247
  10.6.2 Contractual Agreements: Nuptial Settlement, Financial Agreement, and Contracting Out ......................................................... 247
  10.6.3 Polygamous Marriage and De Facto Relationship ................................................................. 248
10.6.4 Mismanagement of the Matrimonial Property ... 250
10.6.5 Dispute Between Spouses as to the Title or Possession of a Property ......................... 251
CHAPTER 6

HUMAN CAPITAL AS MATRIMONIAL PROPERTY

Norialh Ibrahim & Najibah Mohd. Zin

6.0  INTRODUCTION

In many instances of marriage breakdown the most valuable economic asset is the earning capacity of one or both of them. In fact it has been a subject for discussion in several jurisdictions whether such earning power constitutes a form of “property” divisible between husband and wife on divorce.¹

The question of human capital and whether it is property within the context of marriage and divorce has been a “hot” topic since the early seventies.² The issue centers on whether enhancements to human capital or earning capacity, which are often the major assets acquired

¹ Kevin J. Gray, *Reallocation of property on divorce*, p. 169. According to him in some jurisdictions, factors related to earning capacity are merely regarded as relevant considerations in the equitable distribution of other property.