Scopus

Documents

Ghani, A.S.A.[a] [b] , Rahim, A.F.A.[b] , Yusoff, M.S.B.[b] , Hadie, S.N.H.[c]

Effective Learning Behavior in Problem-Based Learning: a Scoping Review
(2021) *Medical Science Educator*, 31 (3), pp. 1199-1211. Cited 23 times.

[a] Department of Basic Medical Sciences, Kulliyah of Medicine, Bandar Indera Mahkota Campus, International Islamic University Malaysia, Kuantan, Pahang 25200, Malaysia
[b] Department of Medical Education, School of Medical Sciences, Health Campus, Universiti Sains Malaysia, Kubang Kerian, Kota Bharu, Kelantan 16150, Malaysia
[c] Department of Anatomy, School of Medical Sciences, Health Campus, Universiti Sains Malaysia, Kubang Kerian, Kota Bharu, Kelantan 16150, Malaysia

Abstract
Problem-based learning (PBL) emphasizes learning behavior that leads to critical thinking, problem-solving, communication, and collaborative skills in preparing students for a professional medical career. However, learning behavior that develops these skills has not been systematically described. This review aimed to unearth the elements of effective learning behavior in a PBL context, using the protocol by Arksey and O'Malley. The protocol identified the research question, selected relevant studies, charted and collected data, and collated, summarized, and reported results. We discovered three categories of elements—intrinsic empowerment, entrustment, and functional skills—proven effective in the achievement of learning outcomes in PBL. © 2021, International Association of Medical Science Educators.

Author Keywords
Academic outcomes; Effective learning behavior; Higher education; Problem-based learning; Student behavior

References

- Barrows, H.S.
  Problem-based learning in medicine and beyond: A brief overview
  (1996) *New Dir Teach Learn*, 68, pp. 3-12.

- Barrows, H., Tamblyn, R.
  (1980) *Problem-Based Learning: An Approach to Medical Education*,
  Springer Publishing Company

- **Problem-based learning: Where are we now? Med Teach**
  (2008) *Taylor & Francis*, 30 (8), pp. 742-763.

- Rakhudu, M.A.
  (2015) *Use of problem based scenarios to prepare nursing students to address quality improvement in health care unit: Int J Educ Sci*, 10 (1), pp. 72-80.

- Radcliffe, P., Kumar, D.
  Is problem-based learning suitable for engineering ?
  (2016) *Australas J Eng Educ*, 21 (2), pp. 81-88.

- Azer, S.A., Hasanato, R., Al-Nassar, S., Somily, A., AlSaadi, M.M.
  Introducing integrated laboratory classes in a PBL curriculum: impact on student's learning and satisfaction
  (2013) *BMC Med Educ*, 13 (1), pp. 1-12.

- Doherty, D.O., Mc Keague, H., Harney, S., Browne, G., McGrath, D.
  What can we learn from problem-based learning tutors at a graduate entry medical school? A mixed method approach
  (2018) *BMC Med Educ*, 18 (1), pp. 1-12.

- Choi, E., Lindquist, R., Song, Y.
  Effects of problem-based learning vs. traditional lecture on Korean nursing students' critical thinking, problem-solving, and self-directed learning
  (2014) *Nurse Educ Today*, 34 (1), pp. 52-56.

- Wong, D.K.P., Lam, D.O.B.
  Problem-based learning in social work: a study of student learning outcomes
  (2007) *Res Soc Work Pract*, 17 (1), pp. 55-56.

- Wijnen, M., Loyens, S.M.M., Smeets, G., Kroeze, M., van der Molen, H.
  Comparing problem-based learning students to students in a lecture-based curriculum: learning strategies and the relation with self-study time
  (2017) *Eur J Psychol Educ*, 32 (3), pp. 431-447.

- Armitage, A., Pihl, O., Rybergprocesses, T.P.
  (2015) *Journal of Problem Based Learning in Higher Education*, 3 (1).

- Harun, N.F., Yusof, K.M., Jamaludin, M.Z., Hassan, S.A.H.S.
  Motivation in Problem-based Learning Implementation
  (2012) *Procedia Soc Behav Sci*, 56, pp. 233-242.

- Smith, G.F.
  Problem-based learning: can it improve managerial thinking?
  (2005) *J Manag Educ*, 29 (2), pp. 357-378.

- Akcay, B.
  Problem-based learning in science education
  (2009) *Journal of Turkish Science Education*, 6 (1), pp. 28-38.

-

- Siew, N.M., Mapeala, R.
  The effects of problem based learning with thinking maps on fifth graders' science critical thinking
  (2016) *J Balt Sci Educ*, 15 (5), p. 602.

- Li, H.C., Stylianides, A.J.
  An examination of the roles of the teacher and students during a problem-based learning intervention: lessons learned from a study in a Taiwanese primary mathematics classroom
  (2018) *Interact Learn Environ*, 26 (1), pp. 106-117.

- Wilder, S.
  Impact of problem-based learning on academic achievement in high school: a systematic review
  (2015) *Educ Rev*, 67 (4), pp. 414-435.

- Dolmans, D., Grave, W., Wolfhagen, I., van Der Vleuten, C.
  (2005),

- Wood, D.F.
  Problem based learning
  (2003) *BMJ*, 326 (7384), pp. 328-330.

- Ansari, M.T., Rahman, S.A., Badgujar, V.B., Sami, F., Abdullah, M.S.
  Problem based learning (PBL): A novel and effective tool of teaching and learning
  (2015) *Indian J Pharm Educ Res*, 49 (4), pp. 258-265.

- Ertmer, P.A., Newby, T.J.
  Behaviorism, cognitivism, constructivism: Comparing critical features from an

- **instructional design perspective**
  (1993) *Perform Improv Q*, 6 (4), pp. 50-72.

- Ertmer, P.A., Newby, T.J.
  The expert learner: strategic, self-regulated, and reflective
  (1996) *Instr Sci*, 24 (1), pp. 1-24.

- Billett, S.
  Situated learning: bridging sociocultural and cognitive theorising
  (1996) *Learn Instr*, 6 (3), pp. 263-280.

- Dillenbourg, P., Baker, M., Blaye, A., Malley, C.O.
  The evolution of research on collaborative learning
  (1996) *Learning in Human Machines: Towards an Interdisciplinary Learning Science*, pp. 189-211.
  Spada E, Reimann P

- Ates, O., Eryilmaz, A.
  Strengths and weaknesses of problem-based learning: students' and tutors' perceptives
  (2010) *Journal of the Buca Educational Science Faculty*, 28, pp. 40-58.

- Cónsul-giribet, M., Medina-Moya, J.L.
  Strengths and weaknesses of problem based learning from the professional perspective of registered nurses
  (2014) *Rev Lat Am Enfermagem*, 22 (5), pp. 724-730.

- McKendree, J.
  Experiences of problem-based learning in the UK
  (2010) *Clin Teach*, 7 (4), pp. 262-265.

- Hemker, H.C.
  Critical perceptions on problem-based learning
  (2001) *Eur Rev*, 9 (3), pp. 269-274.

- Davis, M.H., Harden, R.M.
  AMEE Medical Education Guide No. 15 : Problem-based learning: A practical guide
  (1999) *Med Teach*, 21 (15), pp. 130-140.

- Newblen, D.I., Entwistle, N.J.
  Learning styles and approaches: Implications for medical education
  (1986) *Med Educ*, 20 (3), pp. 162-175.

- Albanese, M.A., Mitchell, S.
  Problem-based learning: a review of literature on its outcomes and implementation issues
  (1993) *Acad Med*, 68 (1), pp. 52-81.

- Arksey, H., O'Malley, L.
  Scoping studies: towards a methodological framework
  (2005) *Int J Soc Res Methodol*, 8 (1), pp. 19-32.

- Khoiriyah, U., Roberts, C., Jorm, C., Van Der Vleuten, C.P.M.
  Enhancing students' learning in problem based learning: validation of a self-assessment scale for active learning and critical thinking
  (2015) *BMC Med Educ*, 15 (1), p. 140.

- Li, H.
  Facilitating learning through PBL in a Chinese context: Students' learning outcomes and attitudes
  (2018) *Int J Educ Res*, 17 (7), pp. 80-93.

- Gutman, M.
  The influence of problem-based learning communities on research literacy and achievement goal motivation
  (2018) *Int J Educ*, 6 (4), pp. 31-41.

- Khumsikiew, J., Donsamak, S., Saeteaw, M.
  A model of small-group problem-based learning in pharmacy education: teaching in the clinical environment
  (2015) *IAFOR J Educ*, 3 (2), pp. 95-108.

- William, L., Abdul Rahim, Z., Wu, L., de Souza, R.
  Effectiveness of supply chain games in problem-based learning environment
  (2019) *Game-Based Assessment Revisited*, pp. 257-280.

- Chung, P., Yeh, R.C., Chen, Y.C.
  Influence of problem-based learning strategy on enhancing student's industrial oriented competences learned: An action research on learning weblog analysis
  (2016) *Int J Technol Des Educ*, 26 (2), pp. 285-307.

- Dawilai, S., Kamyod, C., Champakaew, W.
  Proposed problem-based blended learning in creative writing: self-regulated learning in EFL Learners
  (2018) *Int J Appl Eng Res*, 13 (7), pp. 4834-4841.

- Asad, M.R., Tadvi, N., Amir, K.M., Afzal, K., Irfan, A., Hussain, S.A.
  Medical student's feedback towards problem based learning and interactive lectures as a teaching and learning method in an outcome-based curriculum
  (2019) *Int J Med Res Health Sci*, 8 (4), pp. 78-84.

- Johnson, M., Hayes, M.J.
  A comparison of problem-based and didactic learning pedagogies on an electronics engineering course
  (2016) *Int J Electr Eng Educ*, 53 (1), pp. 3-22.

- Tarhan, L., Ayyildiz, Y.
  The views of undergraduates about problem-based learning applications in a biochemistry course
  (2015) *J Biol Educ*, 49 (2), pp. 116-126.

- Hursen, C.
  The effect of technology supported problem-based learning approach on adults' self-efficacy perception for research-inquiry
  (2019) *Educ Inf Technol*, 24 (2), pp. 1131-1145.

- Asmi, S.O., Wonorahardjo, S., Widarti, H.R.
  The application of problem based learning assisted by blended learning in atomic spectroscopy material on cognitive learning outcomes and students' self system based on marzano taxonomy
  (2019) *European Journal of Open Education and E-learning Studies*, 4 (1), pp. 88-99.

- Arana-Arexolaleiba, N., Zubizarreta, M.I.
  (2015) *The Impact of PBL Learning Environment and Supervision of Engineering Faculty of Mondragon University in the Student Learning Approach*, pp. 479-491.

- Geitz, G., Ten, B.D.J., Kirschner, P.A.
  Sustainable feedback: students' and tutors' perceptions
  (2016) *Qual Rep*, 21 (11), pp. 2103-2123.

- Chou, F.C., Kwan, C.Y., Hsin, D.H.C.
  Examining the effects of interprofessional problem-based clinical ethics: findings

from a mixed methods study
(2016) *J Interprof Care*, 30 (3), pp. 362-369.

- Meyer, H.
  Teachers' thoughts on student decision making during engineering design lessons
  (2018) *Educ Sci*, 8 (1), pp. 9-19.

- Rubenstein, L.D.V., Callan, G.L., Speirs Neumeister, K., Ridgley, L.M., Hernández, F.M.
  How problem identification strategies influence creativity outcomes
  (2020) *Contemp Educ Psychol*, 60, p. 101840.

- Kartamiharja, M.R., Sopandi, W., Anggraeni, D.
  Implementation of problem-based learning (PBL) approach in chemistry instructional with context of tofu liquid waste treatment
  (2020) *Int J Educ Res*, 19 (5), pp. 47-77.

- Jeong, H., Hmelo-Silver, C.E.
  Productive use of learning resources in an online problem-based learning environment
  (2010) *Comput Hum Behav*, 26 (1), pp. 84-99.

- Wong, L.
  Student Engagement with online resources and its impact on learning outcomes
  (2013) *Journal of Information Technology Education Innovation in Practice*, 12, pp. 129-146.

- Lee, J.Y., Donkers, J., Jarodzka, H., van Merriënboer, J.J.G.
  How prior knowledge affects problem-solving performance in a medical simulation game: Using game-logs and eye-tracking
  (2019) *Comput Hum Behav*, 99, pp. 268-277.

- Larue, C.
  Group learning strategies for nursing students: Reflections on the tutor role
  (2008) *Int J Nurs Educ Scholarsh*, 5 (1).

- Kirk, C.M., Lewis, R.K., Brown, K., Karibo, B., Park, E.
  The power of student empowerment: Measuring classroom predictors and individual indicators
  (2016) *J Educ Res*, 109 (6), pp. 589-595.

- Mohd, H., Darus, N.M., Saip, M.A., Baharom, F., Puteh, N., Husin, M.Z.
  Success factors of problem based learning for IT courses: measurements on PBL characteristics, PBL assessments and PBL practices
  (2017) *J Eng Appl Sci*, 12 (21), pp. 5514-5517.

- Daud, N.M., Kassim, N.L.A., Daud, N.S.M.
  (2011) *Students as Assessors*,

- Boud, D., Falchikov, N.
  Aligning assessment with long-term learning
  (2006) *Assess Eval High Educ*, 31 (4), pp. 399-413.

- Charoensakulchai, S., Kantiwong, A., Piyaraj, P.
  Factors influencing problem-based learning: Students' and teachers' perspectives
  (2019) *MedEdPublish*, 8 (3).

- Sukrajh, V.
  (2018) *The Use of Peer Teaching to Promote Active Learning Amongst Senior Medical Students. Doctoral Dissertation*,
  Stellenbosch University

- Almomani, J.A.
  Preferred cognitive learning patterns (VAK) among secondary students admitted to King Saud University and its effect on their academic achievement in physics
  (2019) *Int Educ Stud*, 12 (6), pp. 108-119.

- Al, H.D.
  Exploring students' learning style at a Gulf University: A contributing factor to effective instruction
  (2015) *Procedia Soc Behav Sci*, 176, pp. 124-128.

- Anbarasi, M., Rajkumar, G., Krishnakumar, S., Rajendran, P., Venkatesan, R., Dinesh, T.
  Learning style-based teaching harvests a superior comprehension of respiratory physiology
  (2015) *Adv Physiol Educ*, 39, pp. 214-217.

- Kamp, R.J.A., Dolmans, D.H.J.M., Van Berkel, H.J.M., Schmidt, H.G.
  (2013) *The effect of midterm peer feedback on student functioning in problem-based tutorials*, 18, pp. 199-213.

- Parikh, A., McReelis, K., Hodges, B.
  Student feedback in problem based learning: a survey of 103 final year students across five Ontario medical schools
  (2001) *Med Educ*, 35 (7), pp. 632-636.

- Perera, J., Lee, N., Win, K., Perera, J., Wijesuriya, L.
  (2008) *Formative feedback to students: The mismatch between faculty perceptions and student expectations*, 30 (4), pp. 395-399.

- De Jong, L.H., Favier, R.P., Van der Vleuten, C.P.M., Bok, H.G.J.
  Students' motivation toward feedback-seeking in the clinical workplace
  (2017) *Med Teach*, 39 (9), pp. 954-958.

- Bose, M.M., Gijselaers, W.H.
  Why supervisors should promote feedback-seeking behaviour in medical residency
  (2013) *Med Teach*, 35 (11), pp. e1573-e1583.

- Entwistle, N.
  Promoting Deep Learning through Teaching and Assessment. in Assessment to Promote Deep Learning: Insights from AAHF's 2000 and 1999 Assessment Conferences, 2000:9–20

- Tadjer, H., Lafifi, Y., Seridi-Bouchelaghem, H., Gülseçen, S.
  Improving soft skills based on students' traces in problem-based learning environments
  (2020) *Interact Learn Environ*, pp. 1-18.

- Maule, A.J., Hockey, G.R.J., Bdzola, L.
  Effects of time-pressure on decision-making under uncertainty: Changes in affective state and information processing strategy
  (2000) *Acta Physiol (Oxf)*, 104 (3), pp. 283-301.

- Amabile, T.M., DeJong, W., Lepper, M.R.
  Effects of externally imposed deadlines on subsequent intrinsic motivation
  (1976) *J Pers Soc Psychol*, 34 (1), pp. 92-98.

- Ballard, T., Vancouver, J.B., Neal, A.
  On the pursuit of multiple goals with different deadlines
  (2018) *J Appl Psychol*, 103 (11), pp. 1242-1264.

- Taradi, S.K., Taradi, M., Radić, K., Pokrajac, N.
  Blending problem-based learning with Web technology positively impacts student

learning outcomes in acid-base physiology
(2005) *Adv Physiol Educ*, 29 (1), pp. 35-39.

- Stewart, T., MacIntyre, W., Galea, V., Steel, C.
  Enhancing problem-based learning designs with a single e-learning scaffolding tool: two case studies using challenge FRAP
  (2007) *Interact Learn Environ*, 15 (1), pp. 77-91.

- Hidayati, N., Zubaidah, S., Suarsini, E., Praherdhiono, H.
  Cognitive learning outcomes: Its relationship with communication skills and collaboration skills through digital mind maps-integrated PBL
  (2020) *Int J Inf Educ Technol*, 10 (6), pp. 433-448.

- Zheng, L., Huang, R.
  The effects of sentiments and co-regulation on group performance in computer supported collaborative learning
  (2016) *Internet High Educ*, 28, pp. 59-67.

- Maraj, M., Hale, C.P., Kogelbauer, A., Hellgardt, K.
  Teaming with confidence: How peer connections in problem-based learning impact the team and academic self-efficacies of engineering students
  (2019) *ASEE Annu Conf Expo*, pp. 1-14.

- Baranova, T., Kobicheva, A., Olkhovik, N., Tokareva, E.
  (2020) *Analysis of the Communication Competence Dynamics in Integrated Learning*, pp. 425-438.
  In, Proceedings of the Conference "Integrating Engineering Education and Humanities for Global Intercultural Perspectives." Springer

- Lyonga, N.A.N.
  Peer learning amongst students of higher technical teachers' training college (HTTTC) of the university of buea in kumba. Cameroon
  (2018) *Int J High Educ*, 7 (2), pp. 216-226.

- Britton, B.K., Tesser, A.
  Effects of time-management practices on college grades
  (1991) *J Educ Psychol*, 83 (3), pp. 405-410.

- Pagani, L., Argentin, G., Gui, M., Stanca, L.
  The impact of digital skills on educational outcomes: evidence from performance tests
  (2016) *Educ Stud*, 42 (2), pp. 137-162.

- Okoli, C., Schabram, K.
  A guide to conducting a systematic literature review of information systems research
  (2010) *Work Pap Inf Syst*, 10 (26), pp. 1-51.

- Kraus, S., Breier, M., Dasí-Rodríguez, S.
  The art of crafting a systematic literature review in entrepreneurship research
  (2020) *Int Entrep Manag J*, 16 (3), pp. 1023-1042.

Correspondence Address
Hadie S.N.H.; Department of Anatomy, Kubang Kerian, Malaysia; email: snurma@usm.my

Source: Scopus

ELSEVIER

RELX Group™

ELSEVIER

RELX Group™